

Minutes of the meeting of

THE SCOTTISH ARCHAEOLOGICAL FINDS ALLOCATION PANEL

This document comprises minutes from four separate SAFAP meetings held between April 2020 – February 2021. Owing to the impact of Covid-19, these meetings were all held remotely and the only cases allocated were those originally intended for the postponed 8th April 2020 meeting.

Meeting 1 – 6th–14th April 2020, via email

Meeting was held over e-mail due to Covid-19 lockdown and comments on papers and cases were taken over the course of the week. There was no formal agenda for this meeting. Instead, the panel discussed a number of topics pertaining to the Treasure Trove Unit and issues that had arisen since the last meeting (December 2019).

Present: Dr Evelyn Silber (Chair), Dr Stuart Allan, Mark Hall, Paul MacDonald, Jacob O’Sullivan, Dr Mary MacLeod Rivett, Peter Yeoman, Beth Spence.

In attendance: Emily Freeman (TTU), Ella Paul (TTU), Robert Sandeman (Solicitor to the QLTR)

Minutes taken by Emily Freeman.

Cases

Chance find allocations were postponed, with the exception of those where there was no ex gratia award. Any cases without an application were also postponed to allow for a future last resort process.

TT 239/19	Roman Denarius, Camelon	*Scheduled Site*	Falkirk Museum
TT 244/19	Late Neolithic to Early Bronze Age Pottery Fragments, Taransay	*Finder deceased*	National Museums Scotland

Excavation Assemblages

TT 176/19	Mesolithic to Modern assemblage, Aberdeen Western Peripheral Route - Construction Phase, Milltimber and Wester Hatton. Site code ABYP15: 5 boxes of finds, 6 stone finds, 6 boxes of environmental material.	University of Aberdeen Museums and Special Collections
-----------	--	--

TT 174/19	Mesolithic to Modern assemblage, Aberdeen Western Peripheral Route - Nothern Link, Peterculter to Blackdog. Site code ABNL13: 12 boxes of finds, 7 boxes of environmental material.	University of Aberdeen Museums and Special Collections
TT 175/19	Mesolithic to Modern assemblage, Aberdeen Western Peripheral Route - Southern Link, Peterculter to Stonehaven. Site code ABSL13: 21 boxes of finds, 12 loose finds, 23 boxes of environmental material.	University of Aberdeen Museums and Special Collections
TT 186/19	Medieval assemblage, Quein, Isle of Bute, Argyll & Bute. Site code QU10: 1 box	Isle of Bute Museum
TT 188/19	Early Medieval assemblage, Trusty's hill, Gatehouse of Fleet, Dumfries & Galloway. Site code 3309: 6 boxes & 1 package.	Stewartry Museum
TT 183/19	Post-Medieval to Modern assemblage, Seaton Sands Holiday Centre, Seaton Sands, East Lothian. Site code SSHC11: 1 bag	East Lothian Council Museums Service
TT 191/19	Medieval assemblage, Aberlady Road, Haddington, East Lothian. Site code 3815: 1 box	East Lothian Council Museums Service
TT 170/19	Medieval/17th - 20th Century assemblage, Little France path network, City of Edinburgh. Site code AA2215: 1 small box.	Museum of Edinburgh
TT 192/19	Post-Medieval assemblage, Huntly House Museum Courtyard, City of Edinburgh. Site code 3840: 1 box	Museum of Edinburgh
TT 193/19	16th-17th century assemblage, Fairlie Castle, Fairlie, North Ayrshire. Site code 3846: 1 box	North Ayrshire Heritage Centre
TT 177/19	19th century assemblage + 16th century coin, King's Park Path phase 3 (rifle range), Stirling. Site code AOC 23770_3: 1 box	Smith Art Gallery and Museum
TT 178/19	17th - 20th century finds (2 finds), King's Park Path phase 2 (metal detecting survey), Stirling. Site code AOC 23770_2: 2 finds	Smith Art Gallery and Museum
TT 181/19	Medieval - 19th century assemblage, Old West Parish Church, Kilarchan, Renfrewshire: 3 large boxes and 1 small.	Paisley Museum
TT 196/19	Post-Medieval/Modern assemblage, Linlithgow Palace and Peel, Linlithgow, West Lothian. Site code MINA44: 1 box	West Lothian Council Museums Service
TT 184/19	Bronze Age/Medieval assemblage, Scalpsie, Isle of Bute, Argyll & Bute. Site code SBB10: 1 box	National Museums Scotland
TT 249/19	Neolithic Assemblage, Holm of Papa Westray. 18 boxes faunal remains, 7 boxes of human remains, 1	National Museums Scotland

	box of bone artefacts, 1 box of pottery (incl. Neolithic and Beaker ceramics).	
TT 251/19	Taransay assemblage, historic case.	National Museums Scotland

Meeting 2 – 10:30, Wednesday 26th August 2020, online meeting

Owing to the impact of Covid-19, this was the first online meeting of the panel in 2020. While a small number of cases (those which did not require ex gratia awards) were allocated by email in April 2020, this was the first meeting hosted by Zoom and no cases were allocated.

Present: Dr Evelyn Silber (Chair), Dr Stuart Allan, Paul MacDonald, Dr Mary MacLeod Rivett, Jacob O’Sullivan, Beth Spence.

In attendance: Emily Freeman (TTU), Ella Paul (TTU), Robert Sandeman (Solicitor to the QLTR).

Apologies: Mark Hall, Peter Yeoman.

1. Welcome and Apologies

The Chair welcomed all to the meeting.

2. Panel round-up

The Chair suggested a summary of current working patterns and the impact of Covid-19 on individuals would be useful. The key points are summarised as follows:

National Museums Scotland has only recently re-opened to the public and TTU staff are only allowed on the premises in order to meet finders. There is no date yet for when in-person meetings will be hosted, or when TTU staff will be allowed on-site for purposes other than meeting finders. Heavy furloughing in the Scottish History and Archaeology department has also restricted TTU’s access to colleague expertise in recent months. (SA)

There has been a clear increase in the number of unauthorised works on scheduled monuments since lockdown began, including evidence of nighthawking. (MMR)

A rally of the Scottish Detecting Club has been organised, with strict Covid-19 guidance in place. (PM)

Museums Galleries Scotland has received five new applications for Recognised Collections (deferred to next year). There is a Covid-19 Adaptation Fund which is geared towards the re-opening of museums. (JoS)

The Chair raised concern about the impact of Covid-19 on small museums and their capacity to bid for material through the Treasure Trove system. EF confirmed that the National Fund for Acquisitions is currently offering 100% grants up to £1000, and 50% over £1000.

3. TTU Report

- TTU have been working from home since March and processing finds has not been possible. This includes claiming new cases, disclaiming finds and conducting research.
- During the lockdown period, TTU have been developing their case management system, website and reviewing the Access database. TTU have also been producing social media posts, conducting object-specific research to feed into future claims and remote recording finds where possible.
- TTU will be returning to the office one day a week each to recommence meeting with finders.
- Lifting of restrictions has increased the amount of detecting since the beginning of the pandemic, particularly around phase 2 which outdoor activity was not restricted and when travel distance also became unrestricted. Finds are therefore being reported but TTU have been unable to take any of them in.
- Going forward it is unlikely that we will be able to hold outreach events. Although we can work on an appointment system, museums services may be unwilling to host and may not be re-opening until 2021 (particularly those that are seasonal).
- TTU is recruiting a second permanent, full-time TT Officer. Recruitment will take place later in 2020.
- A hoard of Bronze Age horse and wagon-gear was discovered near Peebles. TTU, supported by NMS colleagues, excavated the hoard over 3 weeks. EF spoke to STV, BBC Breakfast, NPR and the story was covered across national and international newspapers and websites.

4. Case Management Demonstration

EF gave a demonstration of the new TTU case management system. The software is in a late development phase but does not yet have full functionality.

5. Ludovic Mann Collection

The panel revisited discussion about the Ludovic Mann Collection and concluded that it should go through the Treasure Trove process.

6. Future Meetings

The Chair noted that in-person attendance at SAFAP meetings has previously been considered essential for valuation purposes.

MMR suggested that detailed photography of objects is often sufficient for panel members; most cases are clear-cut. The panel agreed that individual appointments for the professional members to view complex cases is sensible for now.

RS suggested that a Scottish Government representative at future meetings might also be useful.

There is a need to allocate outstanding claimed cases (deferred from April 2020) by the end of the year. The date for the next allocation meeting is pending.

7. AOCB

EP and RS informed the panel that a legal opinion has been commissioned regarding ownership of carved stonework in relation to Treasure Trove law.

Meeting 3 - 10:00, Wednesday 14th October 2020, online meeting

Present: Dr Evelyn Silber (Chair), Dr Stuart Allan, Mark Hall, Paul MacDonald, Dr Mary MacLeod Rivett, Jacob O'Sullivan, Rona Walker, Peter Yeoman.

In attendance: Emily Freeman (TTU), Ella Paul (TTU), Robert Sandeman (Solicitor to the QLTR).

Minutes taken by Ella Paul.

1. Welcome and Apologies

ES welcomed RW back to the panel after a period of leave.

2. Discussion: historic loans

A general discussion was held around historic loans of archaeological material from private collections to museums. More research into the past relationship between the National Museum of Antiquities of Scotland (NMAS) and the Treasure Trove Unit is needed; future policy discussion is anticipated.

After the discussion RS left the meeting.

3. Cases

See Appendix 1 for case list allocations and recommended ex gratia awards. Cases comprise those which received applications in the initial application stage for the deferred April 2020 meeting. Last resort cases are yet to be processed and were not allocated at this meeting.

SA and MH left the meeting for discussions regarding National Museums Scotland and Perth Museum and Art Gallery applications respectively.

4. Panel Update

SA stressed that NMS and TTU are still working remotely for the foreseeable future, but part-time office access has been prioritised for TTU staff.

JoS confirmed that many museums in Scotland have now reopened; Museums Galleries Scotland (MGS) is trying to keep a clear picture on the sector. Many museum employees are working from home and new funding has been obtained by MGS for museums that are not independent (in addition to previous funding for independent museums).

A discussion was held around long-term SAFAP adaptation. Suggestions were made to move SAFAP meetings entirely online, yet some panel members felt that in-person assessment of

objects could not be replicated remotely. With many museums working remotely and facing financial difficulties, it is unclear if, and how, TTU can process claimed cases. MMR mentioned that the provision of 100% grants from the National Fund for Acquisitions (NFA) might put museums in a better position to acquire TT material than we might otherwise expect. TTU staff to explore whether this is time limited and suggest a plan based on TTU and wider sector capacity.

5. TTU Update

The Late Bronze Age hoard from Peebles, excavated in summer 2020, is due to be CT scanned before excavation of the block in the lab. EF to put together an options paper for this.

Recruitment for a second Treasure Trove Officer is progressing. Candidates have been shortlisted and interviews are being finalised.

A new case management system and website are in the final stages of development. TTU expects a working version will be available by the end of November, followed by several months of testing.

6. Looking Ahead

A review meeting has been suggested for early 2021 (date TBC).

Appendix 1: Cases

The following cases (deferred from the April 2020 meeting) have been allocated to the museum shown with the agreed valuation.

TT 221/19	Post-Medieval Toy Cannon, Marykirk	£35	Aberdeenshire Museums Service
TT 227/19	Medieval Annular Brooch, Fraserburgh	£40	Aberdeenshire Museums Service
TT 228/19	Medieval Silver Annular Buckle, Kildrummy	£50	Aberdeenshire Museums Service
TT 201/19	Medieval Iconographic Finger Ring, Lundie	£100	ANGUSAlive Museums
TT 205/19	Lead Religious Token, Inverkeilor	£100	ANGUSAlive Museums
TT 211/19	Post-Medieval Posy Ring, Logie Pert	£600	ANGUSAlive Museums
TT 214/19	Medieval to Post-Medieval Assemblage, West Haven	£665	ANGUSAlive Museums
TT 217/19	Medieval Strap Swivel, Airlie	£125	ANGUSAlive Museums
TT 222/19	Chalcolithic Flat Axehead, Kingoldrum	£175	ANGUSAlive Museums

TT 209/19	Fragments of Late Bronze Age Spearhead, Stranraer	£75	Stranraer Museum
TT 246/19	Early Neolithic Polished Stone Axehead, Stoneykirk	£120	Stranraer Museum
TT 207/19	Medieval Harness Pendant, Haddington	£100	East Lothian Council Museums Service
TT 240/19	Roman Nummus, Cockenzie and Port Seton	£30	East Lothian Council Museums Service
TT 250/19	Cannonball fragment, Cockenzie and Port Seton	£10	East Lothian Council Museums Service
TT 204/19	Medieval to Post-Medieval assemblage, Crail	£315	Fife Cultural Trust
TT 216/19	Medieval Sword Pommel, Dunino	£150	Fife Cultural Trust
TT 219/19	Medieval Harness Pendant, Balmerino	£100	Fife Cultural Trust
TT 223/19	Papal Bulla of Sixtus III, St Andrews	£60	Fife Cultural Trust
TT 224/19	Medieval Seal Matrix, Burntisland	£40	Fife Cultural Trust
TT 226/19	Roman Denarii Hoard, Lindores	£300	Fife Cultural Trust
TT 231/19	Medieval Seal Matrix, St Andrews	£60	Fife Cultural Trust
TT 232/19	Papal Bulla of Paul II, St Andrews	£65	Fife Cultural Trust
TT 229/19	Medieval Harness Pendant, Elgin	£75	Elgin Museum
TT 230/19	Medieval to Post-Medieval assemblage, Elgin	£1105	Elgin Museum
TT 235/19	Medieval to Post-Medieval Assemblage, Elgin	£895	Elgin Museum
TT 236/19	Medieval to Post-Medieval Assemblage, Elgin	£105	Elgin Museum
TT 237/19	Early Medieval Zoomorphic Mount, Duffus	£185	Elgin Museum
TT 238/19	Chalcolithic/Early Bronze Age Barbed and Tanged Flint Arrowhead, Duffus	£20	Elgin Museum
TT 202/19	Medieval Sword Pommel, West Kilbride	£150	North Ayrshire Heritage Centre
TT 220/19	Medieval Strap-end, Kinclaven	£50	Perth Museum & Art Gallery
TT 225/19	Bronze Age Flat Axehead, Blairgowrie	£100	Perth Museum & Art Gallery
TT 234/19	Iron Age Tankard Handle Fragment, Milnathort	£65	Perth Museum & Art Gallery

TT 245/19	Provincial Roman Vessel Mount, Comrie	£60	Perth Museum & Art Gallery
TT 215/19	Roman Denarius, Cavers	£40	Trimontium Museum Trust
TT 248/19	Early Medieval Penning of Olav Kyrre of Norway, Scatness	£650	Shetland Museum and Archives
TT 243/19	Medieval Silver Coin Hoard, Bucklyvie	£1100	Smith Art Gallery and Museum
TT 200/19	Post-Medieval Vervel, Manor	£1500	National Museums Scotland
TT 242/19	Medieval Farthing of John Baliol, Drumeldie	£3500	National Museums Scotland
TT 212/19	Late Bronze Age Socketed Axehead Blade, Dalkeith	£25	National Museums Scotland
TT 233/19	Romano-British Dragonesque Brooch, Rosewell	£120	National Museums Scotland

Meeting 4 – 10:30, Wednesday 17th February 2021, online meeting

Present: Evelyn Silber (Chair), David Forsyth, Paul Macdonald, Mary Macleod Rivett, Jacob O’Sullivan, Rona Walker, Peter Yeoman.

In attendance: Emily Freeman (TTU), Ella Paul (TTU), Sophie Flynn (TTU), Robert Sandeman (Solicitor to the QLTR).

Apologies: Mark Hall.

Minutes taken by Ella Paul.

1. Welcome and Apologies

ES welcomed DF and SF to their first.

2. Chair – news and current issues

- Covid-19 sector update

JOS confirmed that all museums are currently closed, with most staff working from home and several local authorities having furloughed staff. Museums Galleries Scotland has two phases of funding currently operating: Covid-19 Adaptation Fund and Recovery and Resilience Fund, including support for local authority and university museums in addition to independents.

MMR raised concerns over unauthorised works on scheduled monuments, primarily illicit metal detecting and non-reporting of the recovered finds. The full scope of this problem is unknown and site visits by Historic Environment Scotland staff are not allowed under current circumstances.

- Term of office

ES and PM’s extended terms of office come to an end this year and ES has raised this with the Scottish Government.

ES advises that any Code of Practice review should be undertaken by the next SAFAP Chair.

- Legal Counsel

RS advised that legal counsel is being sought to clarify the legal status of undeclared material in museum collections on long-term loan. A second legal opinion is being sought over the ownership status of carved stones found in Scotland.

- Virtual SAFAP meetings

ES asked for panel and TTU opinions regarding the viability of future remote SAFAP meetings. EF suggested that excavation assemblages can be allocated remotely and a meeting dedicated to this could take place as soon as we are confident that museums are able to apply for material (see JOS update above about sector furlough). It was agreed that the time frame for claiming chance finds is currently unknown because regular access to the office is required in order to assess, record and process finds. A decision will be taken once Covid-19 restrictions lessen and TTU's capacity to assess finds becomes clearer.

3. TTU Report

EF expressed TTU's delight to welcome SF.

- Covid-19

EF confirmed TTU staff are currently working from home full time. Finds reporting has slowed down owing to the recent cold weather, although finders are still reporting material and objects are being recorded remotely where appropriate.

EP raised the point that while restrictions remain in place there is a lack of public clarity regarding TTU's operational capacity and it is difficult to manage finder expectations during what is, and will continue to be, a very difficult period for the museum and heritage sector more widely. The suggestion of a joint TTU/SAFAP/QLTR public statement received broad support and it was agreed all parties would liaise to produce a draft statement.

- Research

EP gave a short update on her recent research focusing on seal matrices recorded by the TTU. She will be speaking at the Seals and the People of Britain conference (15th/22nd March, organised by Sigillvm and the Society of Antiquaries of London) and is also working on a paper discussing representations of St Katherine of Alexandria on seal matrices found in Scotland.

- CMS and Website

Since the last SAFAP meeting the new Treasure Trove Scotland website went live. This, along with the forthcoming case management system and public database have become more of an urgent priority since the TTU team has been working from home. Staff are currently prioritising cleaning of datasets, organised broadly by object type, for publishing on the upcoming database. TTU have also been working on a social media plan and sharing TTU content on a wider range of channels than before.

- Strategic plan

EF confirmed there is a draft Strategic Plan ready for circulation. ES supports circulation and suggests that Covid-19 recovery should be a significant strategic point for inclusion in the new plan.

4. AOCB

- Future SAFAP dates

ES suggested two further SAFAP meetings should be held this year, remotely or otherwise. Dates to be confirmed once TTU capacity is known after easing of Covid-19 restrictions.

- New detectorists

PM suggested there were increasing numbers of new detectorists on social media sites and raised concern about the conflicting advice given to them by other members of the public. PM will continue to advocate for good practice on these sites.

5. Cases

This list comprises the Last Resort cases deferred from the 8 April 2020 meeting.

Number of cases –

Chance finds: 9

Excavation assemblage: 15

*accepting in place of no application

Chance Finds

TT No.	Description	Ex Gratia	Application(s)	Local Authority
TT 210/19	Post-Medieval Silver Coin Hoard, Kilchrenan	£650	Glasgow Museums*	Argyll & Bute
TT 199/19	Roman Assemblage, Cromarty	£65	Inverness Museum and Art Gallery*	Highland
TT 208/19	Post-Medieval Brooch Pin, Durness	£15	Inverness Museum and Art Gallery*	Highland
TT 206/19	Roman Denarius, Abernethy	£30	National Museums Scotland*	Perth & Kinross
TT 213/19	Mesolithic Flint Assemblage, Galashiels	£30	National Museums Scotland*	Scottish Borders
TT 241/19	Medieval Silver Spoon Fragments, Eckford	£40	National Museums Scotland*	Scottish Borders
TT 203/19	16 th Century Gold Finger Ring, Dundonald	£600 (deferred)	National Museums Scotland*	South Ayrshire
TT 218/19	Post-Medieval Gold Posy Ring, Arnprior	£900	National Museums Scotland*	Stirling
TT 247/19	Medieval Iconographic Finger Ring, Kilmadock	£1250	Disclaimed	Stirling

Excavation Assemblages

TT No.	Description	Application(s)	Local Authority
TT 198/19	Modern assemblage, Drill House and Cottage, Dumfries House, Auchinleck, East Ayrshire. Site code 3863: 2 boxes	Disclaimed	East Ayrshire
TT 172/19	19th Century, Dalmeny church hall, City of Edinburgh. Site code AA2288: 1 medium box	Disclaimed	City of Edinburgh
TT 185/19	19th Century assemblage, bell-founding site, Lauriston, Govan, City of Glasgow. Site code RA15077: 3 boxes	Glasgow Museums*	City of Glasgow
TT 173/19	Post-Medieval - Modern assemblage, Inverness Airport Business Park Chill Facility, Inverness, Highland. Site code AOC 70219: 1 box	National Museums Scotland*	Highland
TT 180/19	Post-Medieval to Modern assemblage, Corriegarh Windfarm, Loch Mhor, Inverness-shire. Site code CEIH12: 1 box	Disclaimed	Highland
TT 187/19	Late Medieval - Post-Medieval assemblage, Craggie Bloomery, Glen Oykel, Highland. Site code 3157: 3 boxes	National Museums Scotland*	Highland
TT 179/19	Medieval/Post-Medieval, Newbattle Abbey College, Newbattle. Site code AOC FW 23872; PX 24220: 1 box	Disclaimed	Midlothian
TT 171/19	17th - 18th century assemblage, Hillslap Tower, Langshaw, Scottish Borders. Site code AA2275: 1 small box.	Disclaimed	Scottish Borders
TT 190/19	Late to Post-Medieval, Yarrowford, Philipshaugh, Scottish Borders. Site code 3680px (3616): 2 boxes	Disclaimed	Scottish Borders
TT 195/19	Post-Medieval/Modern assemblage, Abbey House Gardens, Melrose, Scottish	Disclaimed	Scottish Borders

	Borders. Site code MINA43: 1 box		
TT 169/19	19th Century assemblage, Lampits Farm, Carnwath, South Lanarkshire. Site code AA2076: 1 small box	Disclaimed	South Lanarkshire
TT 182/19	Medieval to Modern assemblage, North Durieshill, Bannockburn, Stirling, site code SNDB13: 1 box	Disclaimed	Stirling
TT 189/19	Post-Medieval assemblage, Argaty House, Doune, Stirling. Site code 3414: 1 box	Disclaimed	Stirling
TT 197/19	Post-Medieval/Modern assemblage, Doune Castle, Doune, Stirling. Site code MINA53: 1 box	Disclaimed	Stirling
TT 194/19	Post-Medieval to Modern assemblage, Dumbarton Castle, Dumbarton, West Dunbartonshire. Site code MINA12: 1 box	Disclaimed	West Dunbartonshire

Note: Glasgow Museums confirmed interest in TT 210/19 and TT 185/19 on the day of the meeting, but after the event had taken place. SAFAP agreed by email to accept the late applications and allocate accordingly.