

Minutes of the meeting of

THE SCOTTISH ARCHAEOLOGICAL FINDS ALLOCATION PANEL

10:30, Wednesday 30th August 2023, Chambers Street, Edinburgh, EH1 1JF

Present (in person): Jane Ryder (Chair) (JR), Beth Spence (BS), Peter Yeoman (PY), Dr Fraser Hunter (FH), Emily Freeman (TTU) (EF), Lily Rose Bell (LB), Sophie Flynn (TTU) (SF), Dr Janel Fontaine (TTU) (JF), George Prew (TTU) (GP), Robert Sandeman (Solicitor to the KLTR) (RS), Marcus Dean (KLTR) (MD), Sarah Kavanagh (KLTR) (SK), Catriona Deans (KLTR) (CD)

Present (via Teams): Dr Sharon Webb (SW)

Apologies: Jacob O'Sullivan (JO'S), Mark Hall (MH), Vicky Cowan (VC)

Minutes taken by GP.

1. Welcome and Apologies

JR welcomed SW and LB.

2. Minutes of the Last Meeting – November 2022 and April 2023

All content with the last two sets of Minutes.

JR suggested an action log would be useful (**ACTION GP – Action log**).

3. Chair – news and current issues

JR asked about annual report, EF explained its situation, ready to send over to RS – JR asked for it to be published by end of September (**ACTION EF – Annual report publishing**).

FH highlighted the need for a metal detectorist on the panel. Unfortunately, not in this round but agreed to be encouraged and kept under review.

4. TTU Report – EF

Outreach

EF highlighted upcoming outreach – TTU are attending two rallies over the next two Saturdays (02/09, 09/09), one in Scottish Borders, one in East Lothian. EF highlighted potential difficulties, particularly the use of fields with scheduled monuments – TTU have been liaising with Historic Environment Scotland and Police Scotland. Panel discussed TTU's perception with rally attendees and how Treasure Trove was considered by rally organisers and detectorists coming from outside of Scotland. EF conveyed that TTU presence at the upcoming rallies was just the beginning of engagement and there was more work to be done. LB asked if there is scope for discussing this in the review, MD and SK agreed.

JR asked if it would be possible to get data on the number of known rallies taking place, attendance, and frequency to allow a degree of anticipation **(ACTION EF)**.

MD asked whether people declare that objects were found at a rally, EF said that they sometimes do, but that it is not currently a question on the reporting form. RS said that it would be useful to know the translation rate of objects found at rallies to objects handed in.

Other outreach events coming up includes:

- Shetland, Shetland Museum and Archive, and Orkney, The Orkney Museum – finds days and museum networking. 07/09/2023 – 14/09/2023.
- Aberdeen, Aberdeen Art Gallery – finds day and short talk. 16/09/2023
- Fort William, West Highland Museum – finds day. 30/09/2023
- Scottish Detecting Club, based in Edinburgh – club meeting. 02/10/2023
- Inverness, Highland Council HQ – finds day. 07/10/2023
- Glasgow, Kelvingrove Art Gallery and Museum – finds day. 28/10/2023

JR recommended panel members attend Finds Days.

EF reported that since the last meeting, EF had attended the NPCC meeting at the British Museum, London, and SF had been to Denmark to speak at a conference for metal detecting and networking with other finds recording teams. SF highlighted the difference in resourcing across recording schemes in Europe as well as the finders' attitude, which will be useful to keep in mind for the review. EF reported re-engaging with the Finds Liaison Officers based in Northern England.

TTU also had Finds Days in Dundee, Fife, and a couriering trip in Ayr.

Excavations

EF reported that there have been three excavations since last meeting. JR asked what burden this added to TTU, EF explained that two excavations took one day each, producing little to be dealt with later, while one took three days, producing more finds but with minimal impact on future TTU work.

Heritage Crime

TTU are following up on an artefact being sold online with a Scottish findspot. LB asked how these sorts of cases are usually tracked, EF reported in this instance, Police Scotland had been alerted. JR asked about the possibility of using AI to search and, LB suggested it could be possible **(ACTION: LB to chat with EF about possibilities of AI)**. Panel discussed possible actions to be taken as part of the TT review to improve tracking illegal sales.

EF also outlined a second case which TTU and Police Scotland have been working on – this was flagged to the unit by an auction house. EF commended JF and SF on the large amount of work this has been, and the progress made in the case. RS encouraged EF to work more closely with KLTR for heritage crime.

Backlog

Backlog numbers: 48% of the backlog processed since February, should be completed by March 2024. However, due to the number of artefacts handed in over the same time period, there has been an overall 43% gain.

JR asked that the data be sent prior to the next meeting with EF's commentary

BS asked if TTU uses data management tools, EF explained TTU data management. JR said this was a good point for infrastructure change and financing.

MD asked about deaccessioning of Treasure objects by museums. Several members of the panel explained museum disposal policies.

5. NMS Report

FH explained that, though he is vacating the post of Acting Keeper, he will remain a member of SAFAP at least until a new permanent Keeper is brought on, which was welcomed.

FH also highlighted that the temporary TTU posts have been extended by two years and thanked RS.

FH noted that that NMS are bidding for a large number of cases this year due to local museums not applying.

FH elaborated on the three-day NMS/TTU excavation in the Scottish Borders.

6. KLTR Report

RS introduced the Treasure Trove review team, explained that Dr Stuart Allan will be joining them as head of the review on Monday, 04/09.

RS said to expect a consultation paper by Spring of 2024 featuring analysis and recommendations. MD and SK will be staying on for another year beyond the review to oversee implementation, said that there is clearly a need for leadership and joining up, as well as of sponsorship of TT activities.

As of 31/08, KLTR is a fully-fledged Non-Executive Agency, headed by John Logue and supported by RS and team. RS explained that KLTR will seek to fund TTU through earmarked funding, to uncouple TTU from NMS' general finances and bidding processes.

7. AOCB

JF reported on her investigation of a Medieval sword which was brought up at the previous meeting. The alleged provenance, if correct, would make the sword nationally significant and whilst the type and condition would be consistent with a sword from Scotland, provenance could not be traced pre-2016. PY, JR, and LB agree with JF. FH suggested contacting the local authority archaeologist in case of local knowledge. **(ACTION JF)**

PY brought up that Archaeology Scotland Winter edition will have a SAFAP/TTU theme, and that they would like two main articles, one from JR and one from EF. Deadline 20/10, publication end of November. **(ACTION EF, JR)**

8. Complicated Cases

JR asked in future for a short briefing of the key issues in complicated cases to assist Panel consideration (**ACTION EF**).

Conflicting applications

TT 76/23	Elfshot pendant, Banchory	£150	Aberdeenshire Museums Service/University of Aberdeen	Aberdeenshire
TT 79/23	Bronze Age blade fragment, Banchory	£10	Aberdeenshire Museums Service/University of Aberdeen	Aberdeenshire

Aberdeenshire Museum Service and University of Aberdeen Museums have conflicting applications. Panel discussed both applicants and considered their supporting statements.

Panel agreed that on balance Aberdeenshire Museums Service had a stronger case and recommended allocation to them.

TT 149/23	Ludovic Mann Collection	National Museums Scotland/Stranraer Museum	Various Local Authority Areas
-----------	-------------------------	--	-------------------------------

EF explained that, in April 2020, the panel agreed that the collection should be kept together rather than split based on Local Authority area. EF asked if the panel are still happy that it should be kept together as a collection, the Panel agreed after discussion including some of the implications of the collection being split between multiple museums.

Panel agreed that the collection should go to NMS due to the national significance of the collection.

TT 64/23	Early to Late Medieval assemblage (including burnt bone - possibly human remains), Iona Abbey, Iona. University of Edinburgh excavators site code HY: 8 boxes + 2 archival boxes.	Historic Environment Scotland/ National Museums Scotland - deferred	Iona, Argyll and Bute
TT 51/23	Medieval to post-medieval assemblage (including human remains), Jedburgh Abbey Ramparts, Jedburgh. HARP Archaeology Ltd site code JEDA/JEDA2: 10 boxes	Historic Environment Scotland/ National Museums Scotland - deferred	Jedburgh, Scottish Borders

RS reminded everyone to consider Treasure Trove Code of Conduct Appendix M as the main criteria for consideration. Panel discussed display opportunities at Iona Abbey, research and local access to the material.

Similar issues were highlighted by the Panel for the Jedburgh assemblage.

With some uncertainties re display, research and access, the Panel could not allocate based on the supporting statements and requested NMS and HES to discuss further.

(ACTION: EF to discuss capacity for display, research, and access with the relevant museums)

TT 84/23	Pictish Carved Stone Fragments, Applecross	No applications	Highland
----------	--	-----------------	----------

EF explained the question raised about ownership of the stone fragments. KLTR to be consulted

Panel agreed to defer until KLTR have ruled on the set of fragments. **(ACTION TTU and KLTR)**

9. Cases

Section 1: Chance Finds

TT No.	Description	<i>Ex Gratia</i>	Application	Local Authority
TT 77/23	Silver finger ring, Fraserburgh	£200	Aberdeenshire Museums Service	Aberdeenshire
TT 78/23	Harness pendant, Alvah	£100	Aberdeenshire Museums Service	Aberdeenshire
TT 102/23	Early Neolithic arrowhead, Rathen	£30	Aberdeenshire Museums Service	Aberdeenshire
TT 121/23	Inscribed gold posy ring, Ecclefechan	£480	Annan Museum	Dumfries and Galloway
TT 150/23	Cross slab, Hoddum	n/a	Dumfries Museum and Camera Obscura	Dumfries and Galloway
TT 92/23	Post-medieval coin forgery, East Linton	£5	East Lothian Council Museums Service	East Lothian
TT 103/23	Iconographic finger ring, Cockenzie and Port Seton	£25	East Lothian Council Museums Service	East Lothian

TT 127/23	Roman trumpet brooch, Cockenzie and Port Seton	Waived	East Lothian Council Museums Service	East Lothian
TT 137/23	Early Medieval strip brooch and associated ring, Haddington	£40	East Lothian Council Museums Service	East Lothian
TT 142/23	Early medieval composite weight, Cockenzie and Port Seton	£30	East Lothian Council Museums Service	East Lothian
TT 87/23	Sword hanger and possible early medieval strip brooch, Edinburgh	N/a	Museum of Edinburgh	City of Edinburgh
TT 83/23	Roman siliqua, Maddiston	£30	Callendar House	Falkirk
TT 124/23	Early Bronze Age axehead, Falkirk	£300	Callendar House	Falkirk
TT 80/23	Iron Age tankard handle fragment, Cults	£150	Fife Cultural Trust	Fife
TT 81/23	Ring bezel, Cults	£25	Fife Cultural Trust	Fife
TT 106/23	Medieval heraldic harness pendant, Falkland	£140	Fife Cultural Trust	Fife
TT 111/23	Harness pendant, Crail	£85	Fife Cultural Trust	Fife
TT 128/23	Medieval seal matrix, Culross	£20	Fife Cultural Trust	Fife
TT 90/23	Octofoil heraldic pendant, St Andrews	£50	University of St Andrews	Fife
TT 105/23	Iconographic finger ring, Ceres	£450	University of St Andrews	Fife
TT 130/23	Seal matrix, St Andrews	£40	University of St Andrews	Fife
TT 143/23	Iron Age enamelled stud, St Andrews	£40	University of St Andrews	Fife
TT 85/23	Heart-shaped brooch, Beauly	£30	Inverness Museum and Art Gallery	Highland
TT 119/23	Post-medieval to modern silver annular brooch, Cory and Dalcross	£150	Inverness Museum and Art Gallery	Highland
TT 140/23	Harness pendant, Golspie	£35	Inverness Museum and Art Gallery	Highland
TT 141/23	Finger ring, Golspie	£10	Inverness Museum and Art Gallery	Highland
TT 95/23	2 fragments of annular brooch frames, 1 brooch pin [3 items total], Fortrose	£40	Groam House Museum	Highland

TT 107/23	Lead shot, Roybridge	<i>waived</i>	West Highland Museum	Highland
TT 116/23	Long cross coin hoard, Nairn	£520	Nairn Museum	Highland
TT 117/23	Silver annular brooch, Nairn	£45	Nairn Museum	Highland
TT 89/23	Early medieval-medieval zoomorphic mount, Garmouth	£100	Elgin Museum	Moray
TT 112/23	Silver engraved post-medieval engraved finger ring, Urquhart	£80	Elgin Museum	Moray
TT 139/23	Spindle whorl with inscription, Kinloss	£10	Elgin Museum	Moray
TT 148/23	Cannon barrel fragment, Cullen	n/a	Elgin Museum	Moray
TT 100/23	Cross slab, Sanday	£750	The Orkney Museum	Orkney
TT 91/23	Lozenge shaped heraldic pendant, Perth	£75	Perth Museum and Art Gallery	Perth and Kinross
TT 109/23	Roman escutcheon mount/handle, Orwell	£10	Perth Museum and Art Gallery	Perth and Kinross
TT 118/23	Papal bulla half, Portmoak	£50	Perth Museum and Art Gallery	Perth and Kinross
TT 123/23	Roman kraftig profilierte fibula, Invergowrie	£30	Perth Museum and Art Gallery	Perth and Kinross
TT 138/23	Pictish symbol stone, St Madoes	£2,000	Perth Museum and Art Gallery	Perth and Kinross
TT 66/23	Iron Age copy of Roman brooch, Aith	£30	Shetland Museums and Archives	Shetland
TT 114/23	Penning of Hakon V Magnusson, Scatness	£4,000	Shetland Museums and Archives	Shetland
TT 115/23	Silver hvid of Christian I, Toab	£25	Shetland Museums and Archives	Shetland
TT 108/23	Early Medieval strap end, Doune	£20	Smith Art Gallery and Museum	Stirling
TT 88/23	Early or late medieval stone spindle whorl, Winchburgh	£5	West Lothian Council	West Lothian
TT 71/23	Bronze Age chisel/awl, Airlie	£70	National Museums Scotland	Angus
TT 104/23	Early medieval bell, Lunan	£30	National Museums Scotland	Angus
TT 110/23	Early Medieval enamelled stud, Brechin	£75	National Museums Scotland	Angus

TT 126/23	Medieval incendiary arrowhead, Kirriemuir	£125	National Museums Scotland	Angus
TT 135/23	Kite-Headed pin, Montrose	£50	National Museums Scotland	Angus
TT 136/23	Roman pin, Montrose	£30	National Museums Scotland	Angus
TT 145/23	Iron Age button and loop fastener, Montrose	£10	National Museums Scotland	Angus
TT 70/23	Middle Bronze Age chisel, Clackmannan	£50	National Museums Scotland	Clackmannanshire
TT 82/23	Bronze Age ingot, Clackmannan	£75	National Museums Scotland	Clackmannanshire
TT 86/23	Roman quernstone & pottery, Inveresk	£100	National Museums Scotland	East Lothian
TT 147/23	IA mount / strap junction, Whitekirk	£40	National Museums Scotland	East Lothian
TT 134/23	Swivel strap fitting, Crichton	£200	National Museums Scotland	Midlothian
TT 99/23	Pictish symbol stone, Elgin	£3,000	National Museums Scotland	Moray
TT 68/23	Sterling (penny) of Otto IV, Selkirk	£650	National Museums Scotland	Scottish Borders
TT 69/23	Early Medieval great square-headed brooch fragment, Selkirk	£50	National Museums Scotland	Scottish Borders
TT 131/23	Cruciform harness pendant, Selkirk	£15	National Museums Scotland	Scottish Borders
TT 132/23	Seal matrix, Ayton	£50	National Museums Scotland	Scottish Borders
TT 133/23	Harness pendant, Ayton	£60	National Museums Scotland	Scottish Borders
TT 73/23	Bronze Age pin, Cowie	£10	National Museums Scotland	Stirling

TT130/23 – FH raised the issue of wording regarding “archaeological context”, as the case is not from an archaeological context, but instead from an archaeologically-significant site.

St Madoes Stone (TT 138/23) – FH queried the valuation, but JF explained the issues with valuing Pictish stones, that they do not go to market. The valuation for TT 138/23 was in line with previous TT cases.

Section 2: Last Resort cases

TT 96/23	Prehistoric bifacially flaked flint tool, Kirriemuir	£50	*National Museums Scotland	Angus
TT 97/23	Modern silver buckle, Ferryden	£40	*National Museums Scotland	Angus
TT 98/23	Posy ring, Ethie	£500	*National Museums Scotland	Angus
TT 93/23	Harness pendant, Clackmannan	£25	*National Museums Scotland	Clackmannanshire
TT 120/23	Medieval fede finger ring, Carrington	£600	*National Museums Scotland	Midlothian
TT 101/23	Iron Age beehive quern stone, Cherrybank	£160	*National Museums Scotland	Perth and Kinross
TT 122/23	Medieval to Post-Medieval assemblage, Dunkeld	£1,032	*National Museums Scotland	Perth and Kinross
TT 67/23	Medieval polyhedral sword pommel, Selkirk	£250	*National Museums Scotland	Scottish Borders
TT 74/23	Iron Age finger ring with enamel, Hawick	£100	*National Museums Scotland	Scottish Borders
TT 75/23	Roman brooch, Ayton	£10	*National Museums Scotland	Scottish Borders
TT 94/23	Zoomorphic buckle, Ayton	£50	*National Museums Scotland	Scottish Borders
TT 125/23	Post-medieval sword belt hanger, Peebles	£20	*National Museums Scotland	Scottish Borders
TT 129/23	Medieval seal matrix, Melrose	£75	*National Museums Scotland	Scottish Borders

TT 144/23	Iron Age/Early Medieval spear butt, Soutra	£50	*National Museums Scotland	Scottish Borders
TT 146/23	Medieval penny, possible new die of William the Lion, Sprouston	£1,500	*National Museums Scotland	Scottish Borders
TT 72/23	Bronze Age chisel fragment, Troon	£50	*National Museums Scotland	South Ayrshire

Section 3: Excavation Assemblages

TT 35/23	Neolithic assemblage, Peterhead substation, Peterhead. AOC Archaeology site code 70480: 1 box.	Aberdeenshire Museums Service	Peterhead, Aberdeenshire
TT 36/23	Prehistoric assemblage, St Fergus East Substation, St Fergus. AOC Archaeology site code 70420: 1 box.	Aberdeenshire Museums Service	St Fergus, Aberdeenshire
TT 56/23	Prehistoric assemblage, East Lodge, Ury, Stonehaven. Cameron Archaeology Ltd. site code CA232: 4 boxes.	University of Aberdeen	Stonehaven, Aberdeenshire
TT 48/23	Early Medieval/Medieval assemblage, Baca na Putan, Balinoe, Tiree. Calluna Archaeology site code CA004: 2 boxes.	Kilmartin Museum	Balinoe, Argyll and Bute
TT 55/23	Later Prehistoric assemblage (including human remains), Lower Kilchatton, Colonsay. AOC Archaeology site code FW 23956-19; PX 24174-19: 2 boxes.	Kilmartin Museum	Kilchatton, Argyll and Bute
TT 40/23	Post-medieval assemblage, Drumshanty, Luggie Water, Kirkintilloch. Calluna Archaeology. Site code CA016: 8 boxes.	Auld Kirk Museum	Kirkintilloch, East Dunbartonshire
TT 42/23	Post-medieval assemblage, Baldernock Lint Mill, Milngavie. Calluna Archaeology. Site code CA006: 1 box.	Auld Kirk Museum	Milngavie, East Dunbartonshire
TT 59/23	Medieval to post-medieval assemblage from multiple excavations (1998 - 2003 - Edinburgh Castle Anne Building; Edinburgh Castle Devil's Elbow; Edinburgh castle Crown Square; Edinburgh Castle Dury's Battery), Edinburgh Castle, Edinburgh. Kirkdale Archaeology: 11 boxes.	Museum of Edinburgh	Edinburgh, City of Edinburgh
TT 62/23	Medieval assemblage (from two 2007 excavations), Craigmillar Castle, Edinburgh. Kirkdale Archaeology site code CMC07: 3 boxes.	Museum of Edinburgh	Edinburgh, City of Edinburgh
TT 39/23	Neolithic/Late Bronze Age assemblage, NHS Highland Elective Care Centre,	Inverness Museum and Art Gallery	Inverness, Highland

	Inverness. AOC Archaeology site code 70384: 2 boxes.		
TT 57/23	Viking Age assemblage, Swordle Viking boat burial, Swordle Bay, Ardnamurchan. Ardnamurchan Transitions Project site code VBB: 5 boxes.	Inverness Museum and Art Gallery	Ardnamurchan, Highland
TT 44/23	Prehistoric (flint arrowhead) to Post-Medieval assemblage, Kirkmichael, Balblair, Dingwall. Highland Archaeology Service Ltd site code HAS-KML16: 2 boxes.	Groam House Museum	Dingwall, Highland
TT 61/23	Assemblage contains flint, Barnhouse, Stenness. Kirkdale Archaeology: 1 box.	The Orkney Museum	Barnhouse, Orkney
TT 63/23	Undatable assemblage, Earl's Palace, Birsay. Kirkdale Archaeology site code: 1 box.	The Orkney Museum	Birsay, Orkney
TT 54/23	Iron Age assemblage, Oakbank Crannog, Fearnan. Scottish Trust for Underwater Archaeology: 295 objects.	The Scottish Crannog Centre	Fearnan, Perth and Kinross
TT 38/23	Neolithic assemblage, Dunure Road, Greenan, Ayr. AOC Archaeology site code FW 24761/PX 25011: 1 box.	Rozelle House Museum	Ayr, South Ayrshire
TT 65/23	Iron Age assemblage, Dun Cul Bhuirg, Iona. University of Edinburgh excavators site code DB59: 1 box.	National Museums Scotland	Iona, Argyll and Bute
TT 41/23	Medieval to post-medieval assemblage, St Andrews Cathedral, St Andrews. CFA Archaeology Ltd. Site code MINA72: 1 box.	Historic Environment Scotland	St Andrews, Fife

Section 4: Last Resort cases

TT 37/23	Prehistoric to post-medieval assemblage, Phase 1A & 2B, Upper Victoria, Carnoustie. AOC Archaeology site code 24659: 1 box + 1 large stone.	Disclaimed	Carnoustie, Angus
TT 50/23	Prehistoric to Modern assemblage, Gardyne Street, Friockheim. HARP Archaeology Ltd site code FRIO: 1 box	Disclaimed	Friockheim, Angus
TT 34/23	Bronze Age/Iron Age site, Dean's Park, Dornoch. Finds possibly post-medieval to modern. AOC Archaeology site code 70341: 1 box.	Disclaimed	Dornoch, Highland
TT 43/23	Medieval assemblage, Dornoch Business Park, Dornoch. Highland Archaeology Service Ltd site code DBP21: 1 box.	Disclaimed	Dornoch, Highland
TT 45/23	Modern assemblage, Lagain Bhain, Glenmoriston. Highland Archaeology Service Ltd site code LBD19-3: 1 box.	Disclaimed	Glenmoriston, Highland

TT 46/23	Modern assemblage, Lagain Bhain, Glenmoriston. Highland Archaeology Service Ltd site code LBD22: 2 boxes.	Disclaimed	Glenmoriston, Highland
TT 47/23	Post-medieval assemblage, Aldourie Gatehouse, Inverness. Highland Archaeology Service Ltd site code AED21: 1 box.	Disclaimed	Inverness, Highland
TT 53/23	Post-medieval to modern assemblage, Bombay Farm, Cromdale. Avon Archaeology site code BCF22: 1 box.	Disclaimed	Cromdale, Highland
TT 52/23	Post-medieval/early modern assemblage, Trimontium Museum, Melrose. HARP Archaeology Ltd site code TTMU: 4 boxes.	Disclaimed	Melrose, Scottish Borders
TT 237/22	Post-medieval assemblage, Cadzow Castle, Hamilton. Kirkdale Archaeology: 66 boxes. (Comprises multiple seasons on site 2001 - 2006)	*National Museums Scotland	South Lanarkshire
TT 58/23	Post-medieval to modern assemblage from multiple excavations (2002, 2004, 2005, 2006 and 2007), Dumbarton Castle, Dumbarton. Kirkdale Archaeology site codes DC02; DC04; DC05; DC06; Dumb07: 6 boxes.	Disclaimed	Dumbarton, West Dunbartonshire

10. Final Business

JR thanked the panel. Meeting adjourned.