Minutes of the meeting of

THE SCOTTISH ARCHAEOLOGICAL FINDS ALLOCATION PANEL

10:30, Friday 24th November 2023, Chambers Street, Edinburgh, EH1 1JF

Present (in person): Jane Ryder (Chair) (JR), Beth Spence (BS), Mark Hall (MH), Dr Fraser Hunter (FH), Emily Freeman (TTU) (EF), Lily Rose Bell (LB), Dr Sharon Webb (SW), Dr Antony Lee (TTU) (AL), Dr George Prew (TTU) (GP), Robert Sandeman (KLTR) (RS), Peter Tierney (KLTR) (PT), Kyle McAra (KLTR) (KM)

Apologies: Jacob O'Sullivan (JO'S), Peter Yeoman (PY).

Minutes taken by GP.

1. **Welcome and Apologies**

JR welcomed PT

EF informed the meeting that that the Annual Report is complete, but that the review team requested that the report be delayed to the new year to allow for a larger debut. JR and LB advised that, in the interests of transparency, publication should not be delayed. JR suggested that it be released to link with the Treasure Trove edition of Archaeology Scotland.

2. **Minutes of the Last Meeting and Actions – August 2023**

JR asked about sending details of complicated cases before the meeting, EF confirmed a template had been created for future meetings.

All other actions have been followed through

3. **Chair – news and current issues**

JR confirmed the appointment of MH for a second term

JR thanked EF for resolving the delay and getting minutes on to the website.

4. **TTU Report – EF**

EF updated the meeting on the Applecross stones case: next steps will be to transfer the fragments of carved stone reasonably believed to be part of the stone in Applecross Heritage Centre and, separately, to claim the fragments that cannot be reasonably linked to the original stone. This has been agreed with the KLTR department. EF acknowledged the excellent report written by Janel Fontaine (TTU) on the case.
It was noted that Applecross Heritage Centre is not an accredited museum.

Action from August 2023 meeting required EF to provide information on rallies. EF explained that rallies are a known unknown – the events are happening, but TTU is not necessarily informed, and the number of artefacts being found at events is unknown.

JR observed the need for anticipation of rallies for planning work programs and workloads, EF concurred and explained the difficulties with this, including issues such as rally organisers keeping the location secret until the day of the event, and the unknown number of attendees and artefacts that might be recovered. LB asked if TTU knew the reporting gap from rallies specifically; EF explained that TTU do not have enough data to estimate.

JR requested that planned outreach should be discussed at the next meeting, **(ACTION: EF to prepare a list of planned outreach to be sent before each SAFAP meeting)**.

JR suggested that numbers for these and for find processing should be provided in writing before SAFAP meetings in a structured template, FH thanked JR for the suggestion as he and EF had been discussing this **(ACTION: EF to provide data on finds reporting and processing before each SAFAP meeting)**.

Outreach

EF listed the events since SAFAP August 2023:

Shetland and Orkney: Finds days at Shetland Museum and Archives, The Orkney Museum and The Old Haa museum (Yell). Trip to Westray Heritage Centre for meeting with centre trustees.
Aberdeenshire: Aberdeen City Art Gallery finds event, with all Aberdeenshire museums were present. TTU met with finders.
Highland Archaeology Festival (Inverness): Finds day and museum visits to Cromarty Courthouse, Nairn Museum, and Elgin Museum to deliver and pick up finds.
Kelvingrove Art Gallery and Museum: Finds day
Montrose Museum: Finds day
Big Scottish Rally and Detectormania: Across two rallies, roughly 400 people in attendance.
Glasgow University Seminar: GP gave a lesson in the Masters course in Museum Studies.
Couriering: West Highland Museum, Paisley Museum and Kelvingrove Art Gallery and Museum
Detecting clubs: Scottish Detector Club

JR suggested that it would be useful to have the report on outreach also before each SAFAP meeting, EF agreed **(ACTION: EF to provide a report on completed outreach before each SAFAP meeting).**

Backlog

EF explained that the backlog has dropped in the last 40 weeks from roughly 6,000 objects to roughly 1,300. JR suggested that LB might advise on the most useful data and possible

forecasting. LB and EF agreed. **(ACTION: LB and EF, to analyse the data around the reduction of backlog and application to demand for the future)**.

The Panel also discussed how the progress can be made public, and suggested the Annual Report would be ideal. SW also suggested that shorter, more regular reporting could be useful online. TTU to consider.

JR summed up the picture as very positive, and that the challenge now is to keep demand and capacity in balance through resourcing. This is a key point for the Review.

SW congratulated TTU team to general agreement.

5. **NMS Report**

FH said that NMS have been continuing to support TTU work and reported on a recent excavation. EF explained the timeline for processing these artefacts through the TT system.

BS asked EF to clarify procedure for TT excavations, and KM asked about what constitutes a hoard. EF and FH explained the definition of a hoard is a set of objects which have been deliberately deposited in the same location and explained procedures around excavating them, FH explained the value of fieldwork for context when hoards and significant finds are found.

6. **AOCB**

JR referenced correspondence from Neil Curtis (University of Aberdeen) regarding recent conflicting application cases that were not allocated to the University, and the panel's reasoning for this. Panel discussed how to respond and how to deal with conflicting application cases going forward, including the level of information provided to the unsuccessful applicant and encouraging more discussion between applicants by sharing application paperwork. SW suggested that a face-to-face discussion with Neil Curtis would be beneficial, and panel agreed. **(ACTION: JR to set up a meeting with Neil Curtis).**

KM asked about how museums of last resort function, EF explained that they are informed of cases which have had no applications in the first round of applications, and are then able to apply for these cases.

JR asked for a list of museums of last resort and asked if they have a formal status, EF said that there is no formal status, but that the informal status is conferred on request. MH and FH concurred **(ACTION: EF to provide a list of museums of last resort for the panel)**.

7. **Cases for discussion**

MH left the room

TT 287/22: Hoard of Post-Medieval Coins – EF explained that the finder submitted comparanda and TTU undertook an external valuation for the panel to consider. Panel discussed all of the comparanda and recommended that £10,845 was a fair *ex gratia* award.

TT 287/22	Hoard of post-medieval coins and ceramic vessel fragments, Methven	£10,845	Perth Museum and Art Gallery	Perth and Kinross

MH returned

TT 229/23: Late Bronze Age Hoard – comparanda was provided by the finder, which the panel reviewed. The panel determined that the estimated *ex gratia* award was too low, and therefore increased the recommendation to £12,000.

TT 229/23	Late Bronze Age hoard, St Cyrus	£12,000	Aberdeenshire Museums Service	Aberdeenshire

TT211/23: ¼ penning of Haakon Magnusson – comparanda was provided by the finder and discussed by the panel. Panel agreed that the estimated *ex gratia* award was too low and increased the recommendation to £3,000.

TT 211/23	1/4 penning of Haakon Magnusson, Scatness	£3,000	Shetland Museum and Archives	Shetland

FH and BS left the room

TT 64/23: Early to Late Medieval excavation assemblage – Contested between National Museums Scotland (NMS) and Historic Environment Scotland (HES).
The panel reviewed the supporting statements from both institutions and discussed research and display potential, along with storage and access. Assemblage integrity was also considered.

Panel agreed allocation to NMS.

TT 64/23	Early to Late Medieval assemblage (including burnt bone - possibly human remains), Iona Abbey, Iona. University of Edinburgh excavators site code HY: 8 boxes + 2 archival boxes.	National Museums Scotland		Iona, Argyll and Bute

TT 51/23: Medieval to Post-Medieval Assemblage – Contested between NMS and HES. The panel reviewed the supporting statements for both institutions and considered similar arguments as with case TT 64/23.

Panel agreed to allocate the material to NMS.

TT 51/23	Medieval to post-medieval assemblage (including human remains), Jedburgh Abbey Ramparts, Jedburgh. HARP Archaeology Ltd site code JEDA/JEDA2: 10 boxes	National Museums Scotland	Jedburgh, Scottish Borders

TT 248/23: case deferred to allow for NMS and HES to discuss the conflicting application and submit supporting statements.

[1]TT 248/23	Medieval assemblage, Melrose Abbey, Melrose. Kirkdale Archaeology MA96: 5 boxes	National Museums Scotland/Historic Environment Scotland	Melrose, Scottish Borders

FH and BS returned

8. **Cases**

Section 1: Chance Finds

FH advised that the finder of TT 181/23 be told that the value was adversely affected by the lack of grid references provided for finds.

EF noted that the finder provided comparanda for TT 180/23 but retail prices rather than auction prices.

SW asked about NMS decision not to apply for TT 233/23 as a last resort case. FH explained that this was partly due to budget constraints, and partly due to the case being only an assemblage of coins.

TT No.	Description	*Ex Gratia*	Application	Local Authority
TT 181/23	295x Lead Shot Battle of Corrichie, Banchory	£35	Aberdeenshire Museums Service	Aberdeenshire
TT 212/23	Medieval coin hoard, Marykirk	£285	Aberdeenshire Museums Service	Aberdeenshire
TT 222/23	Inscribed spindle whorl, St Cyrus	£10	Aberdeenshire Museums Service	Aberdeenshire
TT 240/23	Medieval silver fede ring fragment, Stonehaven	£150	Aberdeenshire Museums Service	Aberdeenshire
TT 173/23	Fragment of samian ware and Roman denarius, Auldgirth	£25	Dumfries Museum	Dumfries and Galloway

[1] Deferred to next SAFAP, pending supporting statements.

TT 176/23	Roman Republican Denarius, Middlebie	£30	Dumfries Museum	Dumfries and Galloway
TT 202/23	Bronze Age blade fragment, Kelton	£40	Dumfries Museum	Dumfries and Galloway
TT 225/23	Bronze Age axehead, Mouswald	£200	Dumfries Museum	Dumfries and Galloway
TT 230/23	Early Bronze Age axehead, Cummertrees	£50	Dumfries Museum	Dumfries and Galloway
TT 232/23	Vesica seal matrix, Dron	£35	Dumfries Museum	Dumfries and Galloway
TT 209/23	Medieval coin hoard, Trohoughton	£3,200	Dumfries Museum	Dumfries and Galloway
TT 237/23	Gold finger ring with turquoise setting, Mouswald	£1,200	Dumfries Museum	Dumfries and Galloway
TT 193/23	Early medieval cross slab, Mochrum	£750	Stranraer Museum	Dumfries and Galloway
TT 238/23	Silver stirrup finger ring with decoration, Sandhead	£200	Stranraer Museum	Dumfries and Galloway
TT 215/23	Medieval harness pendant, Kirkennan	£110	Stewartry Museum	Dumfries and Galloway
TT 183/23	Late Medieval Buckle, East Linton	£20	East Lothian Council Museums Service	East Lothian
TT 221/23	Medieval spur terminal, Port Seton	£10	East Lothian Council Museums Service	East Lothian
TT 224/23	Roman assemblage, Tranent	£10,310	East Lothian Council Museums Service	East Lothian
TT 169/23	Roman brooch fragment, Kilconquhar	£5	Fife Cultural Trust	Fife
TT 170/23	Roman headstud brooch, Kilconquhar	£15	Fife Cultural Trust	Fife
TT 171/23	Roman trumpet brooch, Fernie	£20	Fife Cultural Trust	Fife
TT 179/23	Fragment of papal bulla of Gregory IX, Monimail	£40	Fife Cultural Trust	Fife
TT 180/23	Papal bulla of Eugene IV, Culross	£150	Fife Cultural Trust	Fife
TT 192/23	Medieval - post-medieval strap fitting, Falkland	£35	Fife Cultural Trust	Fife
TT 197/23	Middle Bronze Age axehead, Kinglassie	£80	Fife Cultural Trust	Fife
TT 220/23	Early Medieval cross slab, Cupar Muir	£300	Fife Cultural Trust	Fife

TT 228/23	Flat Bronze Age axehead, Auchtertool	£50	Fife Cultural Trust	Fife
TT 184/23	Late medieval figural cross mount, Kilmuir	£300	Inverness Museum and Art Gallery	Highland
TT 226/23	Early Bronze Age axehead, Invergordon	£50	Inverness Museum and Art Gallery	Highland
TT 234/23	Anthropomorphic mount, Kiltarlity and Convinth	£70	Inverness Museum and Art Gallery	Highland
TT 235/23	Gold Medieval posy finger ring, Nethy Bridge	£350	Inverness Museum and Art Gallery	Highland
TT 204/23	Mourning finger ring, Greenock	£100	Watt Institution	Inverclyde
TT 177/23	Roman trumpet Brooch, Duffus	£15	Elgin Museum	Moray
TT 189/23	Early Medieval straight pin, Alves	£50	Elgin Museum	Moray
TT 190/23	Late Medieval cruciform pendant, Alves	£300	Elgin Museum	Moray
TT 191/23	Zoomorphic harness pendant, Duffus	£40	Elgin Museum	Moray
TT 194/23	Two saddle querns, Elgin	£35	Elgin Museum	Moray
TT 213/23	Three silver coins, Duffus	£860	Elgin Museum	Moray
TT 185/23	Ingot mould, Burray	£50	The Orkney Museum	Orkney
TT 186/23	Stone Spindle Whorl, South Ronaldsay	£10	The Orkney Museum	Orkney
TT 187/23	Stone Spindle Whorl, Orphir	£10	The Orkney Museum	Orkney
TT 172/23	Roman brooch, Alyth	£20	Perth Museum and Art Gallery	Perth and Kinross
TT 174/23	Niello mount, Dunkeld	£40	Perth Museum and Art Gallery	Perth and Kinross
TT 239/23	Gold and enamel finger ring, St Madoes	£300	Perth Museum and Art Gallery	Perth and Kinross
TT 207/23	Iron Age sword hilt guard, Kelso	£200	Trimontium Museum	Scottish Borders

TT 208/23	Copper alloy Roman bull, Melrose	*Waived*	Trimontium Museum	Scottish Borders
TT 188/23	Quadruped Buckle, Toab	£40	Shetland Museum and Archives	Shetland
TT 195/23	Three post-medieval jugs, Kincardine (parish)	£200	Smith Art Gallery and Museum	Stirling
TT 214/23	Flat spindle whorl, Gartmore	£5	Smith Art Gallery and Museum	Stirling
TT 227/23	Early Bronze Age axehead, Cowie	£75	Smith Art Gallery and Museum	Stirling
TT 236/23	Gold finger ring, Stirling	£500	Smith Art Gallery and Museum	Stirling
TT 175/23	Roman plate brooch, Dundonald	£15	Rozelle House Museum	South Ayrshire
TT 210/23	Medieval short cross hoard, Ayr	£140	Rozelle House Museum	South Ayrshire
TT 216/23	Post-Medieval communion token, Melrose	£10	Historic Environment Scotland	Scottish Borders
TT 178/23	Four Roman brooches, Montrose	£40	National Museums Scotland	Angus
TT 198/23	Bronze Age spearhead, Edzell	£100	National Museums Scotland	Angus
TT 199/23	Bronze Age gold bead, Inverarity	£200	National Museums Scotland	Angus
TT 218/23	Post-Medieval tap, Inverkeilor	£5	*National Museums Scotland	Angus
TT 274/22	Silver John Baliol farthing, Drumeldrie	£5,000	*National Museums Scotland	Fife
TT 206/23	Iron Age spearbutt, Urquhart	£150	National Museums Scotland	Moray
TT 201/23	Late Bronze Age axehead, Stewarton	£70	*National Museums Scotland	North Ayrshire
TT 231/23	Seal matrix fragment, Dron	£5	*National Museums Scotland	Perth and Kinross

TT 203/23	Medieval finger ring with stone setting, Neilston	£1,200	*National Museums Scotland	East Renfrewshire
TT 200/23	Middle Bronze Age flanged axehead, Newtown St Boswells	£100	*National Museums Scotland	Scottish Borders
TT 219/23	Prehistoric cup and ring stone, Soutra	£100	National Museums Scotland	Scottish Borders
TT 241/23	Neolithic flint arrowhead, St Abbs	£15	*National Museums Scotland	Scottish Borders
TT 205/23	Roman red slip pottery fragment, Livingston	£5	*National Museums Scotland	West Lothian

Section 2: Chance Finds with No Application

TT 233/23	Medieval coin assemblage, Culross	£7,590	Disclaimed	Fife
TT 196/23	Post-medieval cutlery handle, Rosewell	£85	Disclaimed	Midlothian
TT 217/23	Medieval candle holder, Wester Balgedie	£50	Disclaimed	Perth and Kinross

Section 3: Excavation Assemblages

TT 159/23	Prehistoric(?) assemblage, Blackhall Farm, Inverurie. Headland Archaeology Site code BHFI08: 1 bag + flots and retents.	Aberdeenshire Museums Service	Inverurie, Aberdeenshire
TT 151/23	Chalcolithic and Early Bronze Age assemblage (including human remains), Port Elphinstone, Kintore. University of Reading: 14 boxes.	*National Museums Scotland	Port Elphinstone, Aberdeenshire
TT 167/23	Medieval assemblage, Barholm Castle, Kirkmabreck. Kirkdale Archaeology, site code BH03: 1 box.	Stewartry Museum	Kirkmabreck, Dumfries and Galloway
TT 155/23	Medieval to Modern assemblage, Sugarhouse Close, 160 Canongate, Edinburgh. Headland Archaeology Site code SCED10: 12 boxes.	Museum of Edinburgh	Edinburgh, City of Edinburgh

TT 156/23	Medieval to modern assemblage, Edinburgh Trams, Edinburgh. Headland Archaeology Site code ETD07: 51 boxes	Museum of Edinburgh	Edinburgh, City of Edinburgh
TT 158/23	Modern assemblage, Castle Gogar Rigg Development, Edinburgh. Headland Archaeology Site code CGRD17: 1 box	Museum of Edinburgh	Edinburgh, City of Edinburgh
TT 164/23	Post-Medieval assemblage, New Street Gasworks, Edinburgh. AOC Archaeology, Site code 20974: 32 boxes.	Museum of Edinburgh	Edinburgh, City of Edinburgh
TT 244/23	Bronze Age assemblage (including human remains), Shieldaig. Site code HNG85SW003: 1 box.	Gairloch Museum	Shieldaig, Highland
TT 165/23	Prehistoric to Post-Medieval assemblage, Eilean Donan Castle, Dornie. FAS Heritage, Site code LDC 08-17: 70 boxes; 23 Stewart storers.	*National Museums Scotland	Kintail, Highland
TT 157/23	Prehistoric to modern assemblage, Calliachar Wind Farm, Dull. Headland Archaeology Site code CALL11: 3 boxes.	*National Museums Scotland	Dull, Perth and Kinross
TT 242/23	Early medieval cross slab fragment, Linn O'Dees Pub, Rutherglen. 1 stone.	Low Parks Museum	Rutherglen, South Lanarkshire
TT 243/23	Neolithic assemblage, St Kilda. Site code: St.K.96: 1 box.	Museum nan Eilean	St Kilda, Comhairle nan Eilean Siar
TT 161/23	1 stone tool, Torwood Broch, Falkirk. Dr Murray Cook: 1 object	National Museums Scotland	Torwood, Falkirk
TT 154/23	Medieval to Modern assemblage, 100 North Street, St Andrews. Headland Archaeology Site code PNSA15: 6 boxes.	National Museums Scotland	St Andrews, Fife
TT 153/23	Roman assemblage, Netherdale-Galashiels OHL Rebuild, Melrose. Headland Archaeology (UK) Ltd site code NSPG16: 1 box.	National Museums Scotland	Melrose, Scottish Borders
TT 160/23	Prehistoric; Modern assemblage, Keir Hill of Gargunnock, Gargunnock. Dr Murray Cook excavator: 7 objects, 5 coarse stones, 1 piece of slag, 1 lithic.	National Museums Scotland	Gargunnock, Stirling

Section 4: Excavation Assemblages, No Application

TT 246/23	Two pieces of undated lithics, Medieval site, Kildalloig Estate, Kintyre. Argyll Archaeology Site code 154 KIL: 1 small bag.	Disclaimed	Campbeltown, Argyll and Bute
TT 49/23	Single piece of iron, Cargilfield School, Cramond, Edinburgh. CFA Archaeology Ltd site code CARG: 1 box.	Disclaimed	Edinburgh, City of Edinburgh
TT 247/23	Post-Medieval assemblage, Trinity House, Edinburgh. Kirkdale Archaeology: 1 box	Disclaimed	Edinburgh, City of Edinburgh
TT 249/23	Modern assemblage, Duddingston Loch, Edinburgh. Kirkdale Archaeology: 1 box	Disclaimed	Edinburgh, City of Edinburgh
TT 162/23	Modern assemblage, Bar Hill, Antonine Wall. CFA Archaeology Ltd. Site code MINA146: 1 box.	Disclaimed	Kirkintilloch, East Dunbartonshire
TT 166/23	Medieval to Early Modern assemblage, Aberdour Castle and St Fillian's Churchyard, Aberdour. Kirkdale Archaeology, Site code Aberdour 07: 9 boxes.	Disclaimed	Aberdour, Fife
TT 163/23	Possibly Prehistoric; Modern assemblage, Caithness-Moray-Shetland HVDC Link, Moray. CFA Archaeology Ltd. Site code ABBH1: 1 box.	Disclaimed	Keith, Moray
TT 168/23	19th/20th century assemblage, Burghead Well, Burghead. Kirkdale Archaeology: 1 box	Disclaimed	Burghead, Moray
TT 152/23	Modern assemblage, Cliffvale Road, Chryston. Headland Archaeology (UK) Ltd site code CRCN21: 1 box.	Disclaimed	Chryston, North Lanarkshire

9. **Final Business**

EF raised an assemblage from the previous panel meeting, in which the panel mistakenly did not discuss finder submitted comparanda. The Panel reviewed the case and determined that in this instance the *ex gratia* award recommended was appropriate and should not be increased.

End of meeting.