

## THE SCOTTISH ARCHAEOLOGICAL FINDS ALLOCATION PANEL

13:00, Wednesday 15<sup>th</sup> May 2024; Crown Office, 25 Chambers Street, Edinburgh, EH1 1LA

**Present (in person):** Jane Ryder (Chair) (JR), Beth Spence (HES)(BS), Peter Yeoman (PY), Hugo Anderson-Whymark (NMS)(HA-W), Emily Freeman (TTU) (EF), Lily Bell (LB), Sophie Flynn (TTU) (SF), George Prew (TTU) (GP), Robert Sandeman (KLTR) (RS), Peter Tierney (KLTR) (PT), Mark Hall (MH), Kyle McAra (KLTR) (KMCA)

**Apologies:** Sharon Webb (SW), Jacob O'Sullivan (MGS) (JO'S)

Minutes taken by GP.

### 1. Minutes of the Last Meeting and Action Plan

JR welcomed everyone and suggested that AOB be used partially for reflection on the Annual Review.

The minutes were accepted without change.

Panel asked LB and EF about the possibilities of AI for heritage crime work. EF updated that discussion so far has been about data collection, particularly timescales and complexity of data, and that she and LB will discuss heritage crime further soon. LB agreed. KMCA added that the review is considering criminal enforcement.

JR commended the amount of outreach TTU have undertaken and encouraged panel members to attend events.

JR updated that a meeting has not been set up for Aberdeen/Aberdeenshire, but that she and EF had agreed leaving until after this meeting to discuss).

JR asked EF about an action point to do with last resort cases. EF explained that the last resort (or second round) application process needs to be reviewed to allow for museums to have time for discussion internally and externally, and so the TTU can support those applications with enough time to update the panel ahead of SAFAP. MH further explained the paperwork involved in Last Resort applications, HA-W and BS added to this, saying that currently Last Resort conversations happen internally, but that having the information publicly early in the process would be useful (**ACTION: EF to review Last Resort procedure**). MH asked whether this was an issue which the review was looking at, EF and RS said they likely are. KMCA suggested that this is a question for the changes to the Code of Practice. General agreement.

### 2. Matters Arising

None.

### 3. Complicated Cases

## Section 1: Conflicting cases and finder comparanda

TT 252/23	Incomplete Roman plate brooch, Stonehaven	£10	University of Aberdeen Museums/ Aberdeenshire Museums Service	Aberdeenshire
TT 288/23	Lead projectile casting waste, Glen Shiel	£20	Inverness Museum and Art Gallery	Highland
TT 262/23	William the Lion penny, Cargill	£2,500	Perth Museum and Art Gallery	Perth and Kinross
TT 223/23	Late Bronze Age hoard, Peebles	£80,000 - £100,000	National Museums Scotland	Scottish Borders

**TT 252/23** – In summary Aberdeenshire Museum Service’s stance is that they are building up the service, and the University’s stance is that they are maintaining a nationally-significant collection of Roman objects. Discussion covered whether the object is better suited to research or display that it does not appear to be a suitable display object, possibly making the University application stronger, and the fact that Aberdeenshire Museum Service will not be in a position to display for a few years. The Panel commended the strength of both applications and the welcome conversation between the parties.

Decided in favour of University of Aberdeen Museums.

**TT 288/23** – JR explained that the finder has provided separate valuation comparanda. EF gave background that this comparandum, which related to lead shot from Culloden, was considered by SAFAP several years ago and there was a recommended increase in *ex gratia* award. The main comparandum for that was lead shot from Culloden which had been transformed into cufflinks, general agreement that this comparandum should not stand as this is a transformed object, and that the present case is archaeologically interesting but that this should not increase its monetary value.

**Valuation unchanged.**

**TT 262/23** – Panel discussed the external valuation and the points raised by the finder, including the “inflation rate” and publication of the case.

Panel agreed that the *ex gratia* award was too low and increased it to £3,000

*HA-W left the room.*

**TT 223/23** –JR commended the report for its detail and fascinating content. EF gave a brief overview of the case and noted that the hoard is unique.

The panel discussed the external valuation in detail and considered the valuation range given. Valuation agreed at £80,000.

Panel members commended the finder and their actions throughout the process.

#### 4. Cases

##### Chance finds

##### Section 2: Chance finds

TT 263/23	Spanish Netherlands ducaton of Charles II, Banchory-Ternan	£200	Aberdeenshire Museums Service	Aberdeenshire
TT 267/23	James I billon penny, Fraserburgh	£400	Aberdeenshire Museums Service	Aberdeenshire
TT 268/23	King John (Hans) of Denmark silver hvid, Fraserburgh	£80	Aberdeenshire Museums Service	Aberdeenshire
TT 271/23	Medieval seal matrix standing figure, Inverurie	£200	Aberdeenshire Museums Service	Aberdeenshire
TT 272/23	Medieval seal matrix with face, Inverurie	£400	Aberdeenshire Museums Service	Aberdeenshire
TT 275/23	Early Medieval kite-headed dress pin, Fraserburgh	£40	Aberdeenshire Museums Service	Aberdeenshire
TT 287/23	Lead projectiles, Fyvie	£5	Aberdeenshire Museums Service	Aberdeenshire
TT 310/23	Gold enamel and red stone ring, Port Elphinstone	£3,600	Aberdeenshire Museums Service	Aberdeenshire
TT 322/23	Annular brooch frame, Findon	£10	Aberdeenshire Museums Service	Aberdeenshire
TT 269/23	Robert I farthing, Maryton	£4,200	ANGUSalive	Angus
TT 313/23	Early medieval axe-shaped pendant, Maryton	£60	ANGUSalive	Angus
TT 314/23 - DEFERRED	Possible Roman bird mount, Maryton	£60	ANGUSalive	Angus
TT 264/23	Pierced papal bulla of Pope Martin IV, Mouswald	£50	Dumfries Museum and Camera Obscura	Dumfries and Galloway

TT 316/23	Post-medieval/modern gold boss, Ecclefechan	£70	Annan Museum	Dumfries and Galloway
TT 270/23	Arabic dirham fragment, Kendoon	£10	The Stewartry Museum	Dumfries and Galloway
TT 318/23	Silver annular brooch, Dalry	£45	The Stewartry Museum	Dumfries and Galloway
TT 332/23	Stone spindle whorl decorated, Tongland	£10	The Stewartry Museum	Dumfries and Galloway
TT 254/23	Medusa mount, Kirkcolm	£800	Stranraer Museum	Dumfries and Galloway
TT 257/23	Roman radiate of Philip I, Leswalt	£15	Stranraer Museum	Dumfries and Galloway
TT 182/23	Early Medieval bell, East Linton	£20	East Lothian Council Museums Service	East Lothian
TT 303/23	Medieval stone column base, Dunbar	£90	East Lothian Council Museums Service	East Lothian
TT 256/23	Sphinx figurine, Currie	£50	Museum of Edinburgh	City of Edinburgh
TT 320/23	Silver annular brooch/buckle, Falkirk	£40	Callendar House	Falkirk
TT 296/23	Glass bead, Kilconquhar	£35	Fife Cultural Trust	Fife
TT 290/23	Late Medieval to modern assemblage, Ardesier	£500	Inverness Museum and Art Gallery	Highland
TT 315/23	Iron cannonball fragment, Auldearn	£50	Inverness Museum and Art Gallery	Highland
TT 317/23	Heart-shaped annular silver brooch, Wester Clunes	£400	Inverness Museum and Art Gallery	Highland
TT 327/23	Iron Age enamelled brooch, Cromarty	£50	Cromarty Courthouse Museum	Highland
TT 334/23	Pictish brooch terminal, Fortrose	£30	Groam House Museum	Highland
TT 250/23	Roman brooch, Roseisle	£15	Elgin Museum	Moray
TT 260/23	Iron Age/Roman toggle, Elgin	£5	Elgin Museum	Moray
TT 274/23	Copper-alloy seal matrix, Alves	£200	Elgin Museum	Moray
TT 277/23	Late Medieval to Post-Medieval assemblage, Mortlach	£928	Elgin Museum	Moray
TT 278/23	Late Medieval swivel, Urquhart	£75	Elgin Museum	Moray
TT 279/23	Star-shaped annular brooch, Lhanbryde	£70	Elgin Museum	Moray
TT 280/23	Late Medieval to Post-Medieval assemblage, Rothies	£110	Elgin Museum	Moray
TT 281/23	Whetstone pendant, Rothies	£40	Elgin Museum	Moray

TT 282/23	Zoomorphic swivel and harness pendant, Charlestown of Abelour	£55	Elgin Museum	Moray
TT 283/23	Harness pendant, Rothes	£30	Elgin Museum	Moray
TT 289/23	Early Medieval stirrup mount, Myrside	£25	Elgin Museum	Moray
TT 291/23	Medieval to post-medieval pommel, Urquhart	£20	Elgin Museum	Moray
TT 319/23	Medieval annular brooch, Urquhart	£30	Elgin Museum	Moray
TT 321/23	Stone axehead, Easterton	£120	Elgin Museum	Moray
TT 324/23	Gold finger ring, Alves	£400	Elgin Museum	Moray
TT 326/23	Middle Bronze Age spearhead fragment, Alves	£25	Elgin Museum	Moray
TT 261/23	Lead coin mould, West Kilbride	£50	North Ayrshire Heritage Centre	North Ayrshire
TT 273/23	Seal matrix, West Kilbride	£100	North Ayrshire Heritage Centre	North Ayrshire
TT 293/23	Early Medieval harness fitting, West Kilbride	£50	North Ayrshire Heritage Centre	North Ayrshire
TT 255/23	Roman brooch, West Kilbride	£15	North Ayrshire Heritage Centre	North Ayrshire
TT 286/23	Polished earth ball, Skail	No ex gratia award	The Orkney Museum	Orkney
TT 292/23	Bone pin, Evie	£5	The Orkney Museum	Orkney
TT 302/23	Prehistoric stone vessel, Lamb Holm	£35	The Orkney Museum	Orkney
TT 259/23	Mark Antony denarius, Clathymore	£15	Perth Museum and Art Gallery	Perth and Kinross
TT 265/23	James I demy, Kinross	£4,500	Perth Museum and Art Gallery	Perth and Kinross
TT 329/23	Folded gold forgery of a Flemish noble, Blairgowrie and Rattray	£50	Perth Museum and Art Gallery	Perth and Kinross
TT 333/23	Early medieval bell, Drumelzier	£10	LiveBorders	Scottish Borders
TT 276/23	Early medieval to late medieval copper alloy key bow, Unst	No ex gratia award	Shetland Museum and Archives	Shetland
TT 251/23	Two Roman brooches, Carstairs	£10	Biggar and Upper Clydesdale Museum	South Lanarkshire
TT 328/23	Two Roman coins, Stirling	£20	Smith Art Gallery and Museum	Stirling
TT 304/23	Middle Bronze Age axehead, Plean	£75	Smith Art Gallery and Museum	Stirling
TT 294/23	Iron Age pottery (incl. associated human remains), Barra	£60	Museum nan Eilean	Western Isles
TT 295/23	Early Medieval needle case, Galson	£20	Museum nan Eilean	Western Isles

TT 297/23	Drimore assemblage, South Uist	£85	Museum nan Eilean	Western Isles
TT 298/23	Ardivachar assemblage, South Uist	£4,770	Museum nan Eilean	Western Isles
TT 299/23	Early medieval lead die or mount, South Uist	£10	Museum nan Eilean	Western Isles
TT 300/23	Early medieval ferrule and casket mount, South Uist	£120	Museum nan Eilean	Western Isles
TT 311/23	Medieval pins and strap-end, North Uist	No ex gratia award	Museum nan Eilean	Western Isles
TT 312/23	Prehistoric assemblage, Lewis	£386	Museum nan Eilean	Western Isles
TT 330/23	Long cross penny hoard, Barvas	£260	Museum nan Eilean	Western Isles
TT 305/23	Bronze Age blade fragments, Carnoustie	£720	National Museums Scotland	Angus
TT 285/23	Composite Shot, Rhu	£15	National Museums Scotland	Argyll and Bute
TT 309/23	Gold finger ring, Cowie	£2,500	National Museums Scotland	Stirling
TT 301/23	Stone spindle whorl, Kirriemuir	£10	*National Museums Scotland	Angus
TT 306/23	Middle Bronze Age axehead, Carnoustie	£100	*National Museums Scotland	Angus
TT 307/23	Bronze Age blade fragment, Newtonmill	£10	*National Museums Scotland	Angus
TT 253/23	Roman denarius fragment	£5	*National Museums Scotland	Angus
TT 325/23	Copper-alloy Fede ring, Tannardice	£50	*National Museums Scotland	Angus
TT 308/23	Bronze Age blade fragment, West Kilbride	£15	*National Museums Scotland	North Ayrshire
TT 284/23	Composite shot, Langbank	£15	*National Museums Scotland	Renfrewshire

**TT 313/23** – Panel noted that the finder had challenged the valuation, but had not provided any further comparanda for consideration.

**TT 329/23** – Panel noted that the finder had challenged the valuation but had not provided appropriate comparanda for consideration.

**TT 314/23** – HA-W noted the possibility for XRF raised in the report. General agreement that the case should be deferred to allow for XRF analysis.

**TT 294/23** – BS asked about the human remains, EF noted that this is a backlog case dating to before any of the TTU staff were in post, and that the initial circumstances of the find are lost.

**TT 290/23** – JR highlighted as a key example of the positive impact of increased TTU capacity, noting that the large assemblage had come to the unit in 2012.

**TT 276/23** – GP explained the circumstances of the find as coming from a scheduled monument.

### Section 3: Excavation Assemblages

TT 344/23	Post Medieval assemblage, SGN Glens of Foundland, Aberdeenshire. AOC Archaeology site code FW 25792; PX 26161: 1 box.	Aberdeenshire Museums Service	Insch, Aberdeenshire
TT 338/23	Prehistoric and Modern assemblage, Barnashaig, North Knapdale. Argyll Archaeology site code 324: 2 boxes.	Kilmartin Museum	North Knapdale, Argyll and Bute
TT 341/23	Modern assemblage, 3 King Street, Rothesay. Rathmell Archaeology site code RA07065: 1 box.	Bute Museum	Rothesay, Argyll and Bute
TT 349/23	Bronze Age assemblage, Creag Bhreac, Kilmichael Glassary. Argyll Archaeology site code 336: 1 box.	Kilmartin Museum	Kilmartin, Argyll and Bute
TT 350/23	Mesolithic assemblage, Donich Park, Lochgoilhead. Argyll Archaeology site code 089: 1 tub and 2 bags.	Kilmartin Museum	Lochgoilhead and Kilmorich, Argyll and Bute
TT 357/23	19th Century and Modern assemblage, Bogany Road, Rothesay. Rathmell Archaeology site code RA10050: 1 box.	Bute Museum	Rothesay, Argyll and Bute
TT 366/23	Prehistoric assemblage, Dunbeg, Oban. Argyll Archaeology site code 176: 4 small tubs and worked stone.	Kilmartin Museum	Oban, Argyll and Bute
TT 367/23	Prehistoric, Norse and Medieval assemblage, Dunstaffnage Marine Science Park. Argyll Archaeology site code 131: 3 small tubs.	Kilmartin Museum	Dunstaffnage, Argyll and Bute
TT 339/23	Modern assemblage, Nether Murthat, Beattock. Rathmell Archaeology site code RA03024: 1 box.	Dumfries Museum and Camera Obscura	Kirkpatrick-Juxta, Dumfries and Galloway
TT 360/23	19th and 20th century assemblage, Barburgh Mill Quarry extension. Rathmell Archaeology site code RA11010: 1 box.	Dumfries Museum and Camera Obscura	Closeburn, Dumfries and Galloway
TT 354/23	Medieval to Post Medieval assemblage, Hallhill, Dunbar. Rathmell Archaeology site code RA08023: 1 box.	East Lothian Council Museums Service	Dunbar, East Lothian

TT 335/23	Later Prehistoric assemblage, Braehead, Glasgow. AOC Archaeology site code FW 3301; PX 3249: 10 boxes.	Glasgow Museums	City of Glasgow
TT 348/23	Prehistoric assemblage (inc. human remains), Callachy Hill cairn, Highland, excavated in 1906 and in the stores of National Museums Scotland: 1 box.	Cromarty Courthouse Museum	Rosemarkie, Highland
TT 336/23	Neolithic to Medieval assemblage, Bertha Park, Perth. AOC Archaeology site code FW 22456; PX 23746: 3 boxes.	Perth Museum and Art Gallery	Redgorton, Perth and Kinross
TT 248/23	Medieval assemblage, Melrose Abbey, Melrose. Kirkdale Archaeology MA96: 5 boxes	Historic Environment Scotland	Melrose, Scottish Borders
TT 368/23	Early Neolithic to late Bronze Age assemblage, David Moyes Road, Carnoustie. Guard Archaeology site code 4788px (4513, 4572): 23 boxes, 5 loose packages.	National Museums Scotland	Carnoustie, Angus
TT 342/23	Medieval assemblage, Bishop's House, Isle of Iona. Argyll Archaeology site code 202: 1 box (1 sherd).	National Museums Scotland	Kilfinichen and Kilvickeon, Argyll and Bute
TT 347/23	Medieval assemblage, Block House, Isle of Iona. Argyll Archaeology site code 123: 1 box.	National Museums Scotland	Kilfinichen and Kilvickeon, Argyll and Bute
TT 352/23	Medieval assemblage, Duart, Iona. Argyll Archaeology site code 708: 1 bag.	National Museums Scotland	Kilfinichen and Kilvickeon, Argyll and Bute
TT 345/23	Early Historic assemblage, Genlee Substation, New Galloway. AOC Archaeology site code FW 70488: 38 boxes.	National Museums Scotland	Glenlee, Dumfries and Galloway
TT 358/23	Neolithic to Modern assemblage, Kinloch House, Collessie. Rathmell Archaeology site code RA10074: 1 box..	*National Museums Scotland	Collessie, Fife
TT 343/23	Iron Age assemblage, Lower Gaich, Craggan, Grantown-on-Spey. AOC Archaeology site code FW 24419: 13 boxes and 5 loose stones.	*National Museums Scotland	Grantown-on-Spey, Highland
TT 351/23	Neolithic assemblage, Weirston Road, Kilwinning. AOC Archaeology site code FW 23756; PX 24074: 2 boxes.	*National Museums Scotland	Kilwinning, North Ayrshire
TT 346/23	Medieval assemblage, Plot 1, Popple Burn Park, Ednam. AOC Archaeology site code FW 24264; PX 24917: 1 box.	*National Museums Scotland	Ednam, Scottish Borders
TT 340/23	Neolithic assemblage, Duneaton Quarry, Abington. Rathmell Archaeology site code RA06082: 1 box.	*National Museums Scotland	Crawfordjohn, South Lanarkshire



**TT 248/23** – this case was deferred from the November 2023 meeting, pending supporting statements from Historic Environment Scotland and National Museums Scotland. NMS withdrew their application ahead of the May 2024 meeting.

#### Section 4: No applications

TT 84/23	Applecross stones	£150	No application	Highland
TT 266/23	Medieval short cross coin hoard, West Kilbride	£600	No application	North Ayrshire
TT 258/23	Roman denarii hoard, Bishopston	£70	Paisley Museum	Renfrewshire
TT 331/23	Medieval penny hoard, Cockburnspath	£490	No application	Scottish Borders

TT 337/23	Medieval to Post Medieval assemblage, Alva House, Alva. Argyll Archaeology site code 097: 1 box.	No application	Alva, Clackmannanshire
TT 359/23	Post-Medieval/unknown assemblage, Humbie Road, Mearns. Rathmell Archaeology site code RA11007: 1 box.	No application	Mearns, East Renfrewshire
TT 363/23	Post-Medieval to Modern assemblage, Neilston Community Wind Farm. Rathmell Archaeology site code RA11046: 1 box.	No application	Neilston, East Renfrewshire
TT 361/23	Medieval to Modern assemblage, Ceres Primary School Extension. Rathmell Archaeology site code RA11014: 1 box.	No application	Ceres, Fife
TT 364/23	Modern assemblage, Loch Maree Regional Scheme, Gairloch. Rathmell Archaeology site code RA11061: 1 box.	No application	Gairloch, Highland
TT 365/23	Modern assemblage, Crichton Castle, Midlothian. Kirkdale Archaeology: 1 box.	No application	Crichton, Midlothian
TT 362/23	19th century assemblage, Montrose House, Brodick. Rathmell Archaeology site code RA11043: 1 box.	No application	Brodick, North Ayrshire
TT 355/23	Modern assemblage, Mains of Huntingtower Farm, Tibbermore. Rathmell Archaeology site code RA09001: 1 box.	No application	Tibbermore, Perth and Kinross
TT 356/23	Medieval and Post-Medieval assemblage, Watermill Hotel extension, Paisley. Rathmell Archaeology site code RA10014: 1 box.	No application	Paisley, Renfrewshire
TT 359/23	Post-Medieval/unknown assemblage, Humbie Road, Mearns. Rathmell Archaeology site code RA11007: 1 box.	No application	Mearns, East Renfrewshire
TT 363/23	Post-Medieval to Modern assemblage, Neilston Community Wind Farm.	No application	Neilston, East Renfrewshire

	Rathmell Archaeology site code RA11046: 1 box.		
TT 245/23	Medieval to Modern assemblage, Stirling Castle, Stirling. 259 boxes.	No application	Stirling
TT 353/23	Post Medieval / indeterminate assemblage, Poniel Open Cast Coal Mine, Happendon. Rathmell Archaeology site code RA08006: 1 box.	No application	Happendon, South Lanarkshire

JR noted that more excavation assemblages than usual are not being applied for.

EF responded that the excavation assemblages with no application from museums are quite normal, particularly for modern assemblages. In these circumstances TTU advise excavators to offer the assemblages to unaccredited history and heritage groups, as well as HES. JR considered whether this would be worth making explicit in any disposal policy. KMCA asked what the issue with excavation assemblages is, and EF, HA-W, and SF explained that in most of these cases the modern assemblages comprise modern sherds of pottery or coins and so on.

**TT 84/23** – EF explained the finder had indicated that the case will be donated to Applecross Heritage Centre.

**TT 266/23 and TT 231/23** – EF explained the two coin hoards are not unusual and TTU have a full record of the coins

**TT 258/23** – EF explained that Paisley Museum applied for the case after the deadline, due to lengthy internal procedures at the museum.

## 5. Final Business

JR congratulated TTU and the panel on efficient work on the cases.

JR asked if there was anything to highlight or address from this meeting and the Annual Review. RS noted that most of the issues brought up relate to funding, and there was a general discussion about funding and resources.

JR thanked Panel. Meeting end.

## 6. Action Log

- EF to review Last Resort procedure.