

Minutes of the meeting of

THE SCOTTISH ARCHAEOLOGICAL FINDS ALLOCATION PANEL

11:00, Wednesday 5th December 2018, Chambers Street, Edinburgh, EH1 1JF

Present: Dr Evelyn Silber (Chair), Dr Stuart Allan, Neil Curtis, Paul MacDonald, Jacob O'Sullivan, Richard Welander, Dr Mary McLeod Rivett, Peter Yeoman.

In attendance: Emily Freeman (TTU), Mark Hall, Ella Paul (TTU), Robert Sandeman (Solicitor to the QLTR).

Minutes taken by Ella Paul.

1. Welcome and Apologies

ES welcomed all to the meeting and passed on RS' apologies that he would not be in attendance until 2pm.

2. Minutes of the Last Meeting

The minutes of the last meeting were approved.

EF stated that the timeframe for completion of the Annual Report was by Christmas.

3. Chair – News and Current Issues

- TTU Responsibilities

ES commended the recent work between the QLTR and NMS to define their respective responsibilities for the Treasure Trove Unit.

SA stated that there are currently three draft papers (Functions, Conflicts of Interest, Exceptional Circumstances) circulating between the QLTR and NMS. These are on track to be finalised by the original deadline of Spring 2019.

- Mutual Interests

Successful meetings have been held this year between the QLTR, TTU, HES and NMS to discuss mutual interests and how to best collaborate when they arise.

- Scotland's Archaeology Strategy

ES recommended that PY receive an invite for the next SAS meeting. Update to be given at March 2019 meeting.

- Museums of Last Resort

EF brought forward a concern that the time frame in which Museums of Last Resort had to bid for an object was too short. She proposed a new timetable of case lists being prepared eight weeks before a panel meeting instead of the current six weeks. This would allow four weeks for museums to apply, followed by a further four weeks for museums of last resort to apply for outstanding material.

There was general agreement for this from the panel, although a date for the implementation of the new time frame is yet to be set.

- 2019 Meeting Dates

The dates for the first two SAFAP meetings of 2019 were agreed as Thursday 14th March and Wednesday 19th June. The final meeting is TBC.

4. Staffing

SA provided an update that the latest round of recruitment for the role of Treasure Trove Manager had been unsuccessful and that NMS would re-recruit next year. Current staff members EF and EP are remaining in post for the foreseeable future.

5. TTU Report

EF provided an update for the Treasure Trove Unit's activities in 2018. This included a list of the outreach events held by the Unit, including visits to Elgin Museum, Shetland and the Highland Archaeology Festival. EF reported that a large number of finds were brought back down from these events. The Unit has recorded 575 individual objects in 2018, 181 chance find cases and 23 excavation assemblages were allocated.

6. AOCB

ES reported the Church of Scotland's request for minutes from the supplementary meeting regarding the Galloway Hoard allocation. The draft minutes of the meeting and subsequent appeal are being finalised by the Chair.

- TT 46/18 Intaglio Pendant

EF provided the background to a complaint made by the finder of TT 46/18 regarding the level of final ex gratia award. SAFAP recognised that an initial confusion in communication and a subsequent change in staffing within the TTU led to the finder

incurring additional costs. The panel agreed that a letter should be written to the finder and the individual reimbursed.

- PY brought up the possibility of the Treasure Trove Unit contributing in Current Archaeology. There was brief discussion around this with TTU staff concluding that this was something that can be considered.

7. Cases

Chance Finds

Cases with conflicting applications or finder comparanda

TT No.	Description	Ex Gratia	Museum	Local Authority
TT 128/18	Fragment of Stone	£6500	Deferred	N/A
TT 132/17	Medieval vesica seal matrix, Kinnesswood	£225	Perth Museum and Art Gallery	Perth & Kinross

Cases for Museums with no Standing Profile (Standard application form submitted)

TT No.	Description	Ex Gratia	Museum	Local Authority
TT 089/18	Pictish symbol stone, Dyce	£3000	Deferred	City of Aberdeen
TT 057/18	Three Bronze Age axehead fragments, Castle Douglas	£125	Stewartry Museum	Dumfries & Galloway
TT 066/18	Early Medieval strap-end, Carsphairn	£35	Stewartry Museum	Dumfries & Galloway
TT 099/18	Medieval gold coin, St Andrews	£1500	University of St Andrews Museum	Fife

Cases for Museums with Standing Profiles (Simplified application form submitted)

TT No.	Description	Ex Gratia	Museum	Local Authority
TT 104/18	Post-Medieval posy ring, Kildrummy	£600	Aberdeenshire Museums Service	Aberdeenshire
TT 068/18	Medieval fede ring fragment, Kirriemuir	£300	ANGUSAlive	Angus

TT 095/18	Neolithic assemblage, Carnoustie	£75	ANGUS Alive	Angus
TT 076/18	Roman gold coin of Nero, Edinburgh	£1000	City of Edinburgh Council	City of Edinburgh
TT 096/18	Early Modern cannon, Edinburgh	£7500	City of Edinburgh Council	City of Edinburgh
TT 053/18	Roman denarii hoard, Ecclefechan	£1250	Dumfries Museum and Camera Obscura	Dumfries & Galloway
TT 065/18	Bronze Age short-flanged axehead, Longniddry	£180	East Lothian Council Museums Service	East Lothian
TT 097/18	Medieval coin hoard, East Saltoun	£390	East Lothian Council Museums Service	East Lothian
TT 055/18	Bronze Age flat axehead, Colinsburgh	£60	Fife Cultural Trust	Fife
TT 056/18	Post-Medieval gold finger ring, Culross	£1200	Fife Cultural Trust	Fife
TT 061/18	Iron Age strap slider, Auchterderran	£30	Fife Cultural Trust	Fife
TT 084/18	Robert I halfpenny, Ballingry	£1100	Fife Cultural Trust	Fife
TT 085/18	Iron Age/Roman terret ring, Leslie	£75	Fife Cultural Trust	Fife
TT 086/18	Roman brooch, Lower Largo	£225	Fife Cultural Trust	Fife
TT 090/18	Medieval harness pendant, Anstruther	£165	Fife Cultural Trust	Fife
TT 091/18	Post-Medieval seal matrix, Pitteneem	£40	Fife Cultural Trust	Fife
TT 100/18	Medieval/Post-Medieval enamelled mount, Leslie	£65	Fife Cultural Trust	Fife
TT 054/18	Two Roman denarii, Wick	£60	Dunbeath Heritage Centre	Highland
TT 067/18	Bronze Age penannular ring, Freswick	£700	Dunbeath Heritage Centre	Highland
TT 074/18	Medieval annular brooch, Conon Bridge	£40	Inverness Museum and Art Gallery	Highland
TT 077/18	Post-Medieval assemblage, Newlands of	£175	Inverness Museum and Art	Highland

	Culloden		Gallery	
TT 088/18	19 th Century bullet gang mould, Tomatin	£20	Inverness Museum and Art Gallery	Highland
TT 092/18	Post-Medieval posy ring, Rosemarkie	£600	Groam House Museum	Highland
TT 093/18	Medieval annular brooch, Daviot	£25	Inverness Museum and Art Gallery	Highland
TT 105/18	Medieval annular brooch, Stronsay	£80	The Orkney Museum	Orkney
TT 079/18	Medieval to Post-Medieval assemblage, Elgin	£850	Elgin Museum	Moray
TT 060/18	Romano-British brooch, Dunning	£35	Perth Museum and Art Gallery	Perth & Kinross
TT 064/18	Neolithic carved stone ball, Sheriffmuir	£3250	Perth Museum and Art Gallery	Perth & Kinross
TT 070/18	Medieval finger ring, Abernethy	£1500	Perth Museum and Art Gallery	Perth & Kinross
TT 078/18	Medieval key, Aberfeldy	£45	Perth Museum and Art Gallery	Perth & Kinross
TT 082/18	Bronze Age axehead fragment, Kinnesswood	£55	Perth Museum and Art Gallery	Perth & Kinross
TT 103/18	Roman brooch, Kinross	£55	Perth Museum and Art Gallery	Perth & Kinross
TT 106/18	Pictish symbol stone, Perth	£3000	Perth Museum and Art Gallery	Perth & Kinross
TT 094/18	Middle Bronze Age spearhead, Langbank	£120	*Paisley Museum	Renfrewshire
TT 058/18	Iron Age tankard handle, Earlston	£700	NMS	Scottish Borders
TT 059/18	Roman Iron Age terret ring, Charlesfield	£100	*NMS	Scottish Borders
TT 062/18	Iron Age terret ring, Hawick	£85	*NMS	Scottish Borders
TT 071/18	Roman trumpet brooch, Duns	£25 waived	Scottish Borders	Scottish Borders
TT 072/18	Iron Age fob, Lauder	£55	*NMS	Scottish Borders
TT 073/18	Romano-British brooch, Galashiels	Scheduled site	NMS	Scottish Borders
TT 075/18	Iron Age button and loop fastener, Kelso	£35	Scottish Borders	Scottish Borders
TT 080/18	Early Medieval gold pendant, Cockburnspath	£1250	NMS	Scottish Borders
TT 098/18	Medieval coin hoard,	£360	*NMS	Scottish Borders

	Upsettlington			
TT 102/18	Early Bronze Age flint arrowhead, St Abb's Head	£45 waived	*NMS	Scottish Borders
TT 063/18	¼ penning of Hakon V Magnusson, Scatness	£1000	Shetland Museum and Archives	Shetland
TT 069/18	Post-Medieval British and Continental coin assemblage, Scatness	£200	Shetland Museum and Archives	Shetland
TT 083/18	Medieval stirrup ring, Scatness	£60	Shetland Museum and Archives	Shetland
TT 087/18	Two Medieval coins, Mail	£5000	Shetland Museum and Archives	Shetland
TT 081/18	Edward III coin hoard, Crawford	Scheduled site	*NMS	South Lanarkshire
TT 101/18	Bronze Age axehead, Arnprior	£200	NMS	Stirling

Excavation assemblages

TT 117/18	Prehistoric Assemblage, Site Code ABAY; 1 Box. Aberdeen Bay Project, Blackdog to Kintore.	Aberdeen University Museums	Aberdeenshire
TT 118/18	Prehistoric Assemblage, Site Code BROE2; 1 Box. Benholm, Aberdeenshire.	Aberdeen University Museums	Aberdeenshire
TT 116/18	19 th – 20 th Century Metalwork and Munitions, Site Code 117440; 2 Boxes. Barry Buddon.	ANGUSAlive	Angus
TT 124/18	Post-Medieval Assemblage, Site Code DNO16 & DUN 17; 1 Box. Dunollie Castle, Lorne.	Kilmartin Museum	Argyll & Bute
TT 108/18	Post-Medieval to Modern Assemblage, AOC 22769; 3 Boxes. Lochrin Basin, Edinburgh.	City of Edinburgh Council	City of Edinburgh
TT 114/18	Late 18 th - Early 20 th Century Assemblage, AOC 22792; 47 Boxes & 5 Oversized Boxes. Portobello, Edinburgh	City of Edinburgh Council	City of Edinburgh
TT 110/18	Bronze Age to Medieval Assemblage, AOC 23520; 1 Box. Dolphingstone, Prestonpans.	East Lothian Council Museums Service	East Lothian
TT 122/18	Medieval to Modern Assemblage,	Deferred	Fife

	Site Code MINA16; 2 Boxes + 1 Stone. St Andrews, Fife.		
TT 113/18	Late Neolithic to Early Bronze Age; 20 th Century WWII Material, AOC 70148; 70103; 70181; 1 Box. Gorteneorn, Ardnamurchan.	Inverness Museum and Art Gallery	Highland
TT 120/18	Unknown date Assemblage, Site Code DOMY; 1 BOX. Dounreay to Mybster, Caithness.	*NMS	Highland
TT 123/18	Modern Assemblage, Site Code OSBMS; 1 BOX. Petty, Inverness.	Inverness Museum and Art Gallery	Highland
TT 121/18	Post-Medieval to Modern Assemblage, Site Code MINA11; 1 Box. Lasswade, Midlothian.	Disclaimed	Midlothian
TT 125/18	19 th – 20 th Century Assemblage, Site Code 201990; 1 Box. Lossiemouth, Moray.	Disclaimed	Moray
TT 127/18	Post-Medieval - Modern Assemblage, Project 201990; 2 Boxes. Dalry, Ayrshire.	Disclaimed	North Ayrshire
TT 107/18	Bronze Age Assemblage, AOC 22470-3; 4 Boxes. Queenamuckle Cairn, Rendall.	The Orkney Museum	Orkney
TT 109/18	Late Iron Age Assemblage, AOC 23492B; 4 Boxes. Newark, Sanday.	The Orkney Museum	Orkney
TT 111/18	Late Bronze Age Assemblage, AOC 22470-8; 2 Boxes. Skaill, Deerness	The Orkney Museum	Orkney
TT 126/18	Late Mesolithic & Medieval – Modern Assemblage, Site Codes PIT14, PIT15, EC15, EC16, INCH15, FF15, FF16, FF17, SE17; 4 Boxes. Tay Landscape Partnership Fieldwalking, Carse of Gowrie, River Tay shore, Scone Estate.	Perth Museum and Art Gallery	Perth & Kinross
TT 112/18	Medieval to Post - Medieval Assemblage, AOC 244131; 1 Box. St Ninians, Stirling	Disclaimed	Stirling
TT 119/18	Late Neolithic to Early Bronze Age Assemblage, Site Code DEWF; 1 Box. Straiton, Ayrshire.	Rozelle House Museum and Gallery	South Ayrshire
TT 115/18	Early Bronze Age to Late Iron	*NMS	Western Isles

	Age Assemblage, AOC 24209; 74 Boxes. Kildonan, South Uist		
--	---	--	--

- **Discussion concerning TT 128/18 Fragment of Stone**

SA (NMS) and MM, RW (HES) were absent for the first part of this discussion.

ES read out a statement from the QLTR stating that the Commissioners for the Safeguarding of the Regalia were content for this case to be allocated to an appropriate Scottish museum or institution through the Treasure Trove system.

Concerns were raised from the panel that the object in question did not qualify as *bona vacantia* and therefore could not be considered through the Treasure Trove system. Panel members also brought forward the question of ownership regarding the Stone of Destiny, and sought clarification on who owned the stone currently residing in Edinburgh Castle. The manner in which TT 128/18 was declared also gave cause for concern regarding the ex gratia payment. Many panel members felt that any payment should be dealt with by the owner of the Stone of Destiny rather than a recipient museum or institution.

Discussion was then deferred until RS arrived later in the meeting to answer questions and provide further information.

RS stressed that the Commissioners were content for SAFAP to provide a recommendation for allocation even though the object did not strictly fall under normal Treasure Trove remit. SAFAP felt that it could not provide such a recommendation at this point in time and instead offered the following advice:

1. SAFAP are very unwilling to consider any ex gratia payment in a Treasure Trove context.
2. The object does not qualify as Treasure Trove and should therefore stand completely outwith the normal system.
3. SAFAP understands that it is the most qualified body to provide allocation advice and is happy to do so at a future date upon request of the owner of the material, with the provision that it does so in the context of points 1 and 2.

The advice offered by SAFAP will be referred back to the QLTR.

After receiving further guidance from the QLTR, SAFAP were able to recommend allocation for TT 128/18.

TT 128/18	Fragment of Stone	£6500	Historic Environment Scotland	N/A
-----------	-------------------	-------	-------------------------------	-----